

BL
1925
I58
1968

FIRST INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON TAOISM

Villa Serbelloni [Bellagio]

September 7-14, 1968

Sponsored by

The Sub-Committee on Chinese Thought and Religion of the Committee
on Studies of Chinese Civilization of the American Council of
Learned Societies.

Lawrence E. Gerosa
Comptroller

Morris W. Weiner
Special Deputy Comptroller

THE CITY OF NEW YORK

OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER
BUREAU OF EXCISE TAXES
120 West 32nd Street, New York 1, N. Y.
OXford 5-2600

In Reply Refer To:
Room 508
C 107c
Correspondence Unit

The American Council of
Learned Societies
345 East 46 Street
New York 17, New York

August 8, 1957

Gentlemen:

Please be advised that the exemption from the sales tax as an exempt institution heretofore granted you remains in full force and effect under Chapter 441 of the Administrative Code and any subsequent reenactment of the law containing similar provisions, provided, however, that the facts submitted in your original application for exemption remain unchanged. This exemption does not apply to employees of your organization making purchases for their own personal use.

When claiming exemption from the payment of the sales tax to your vendors you are required to furnish said vendors with a copy of this letter.

Very truly yours,

/s/ Morris W. Weiner

MORRIS W. WEINER
SPECIAL DEPUTY COMPTROLLER

C-107c 3/56
MSB:ram

Participants

William Theodore de Bary

Columbia University /

Mircea Eliade

University of Chicago

Angus Graham

University of London

Max Kaltenmark

Sorbonne

Arthur E. Link

University of British Columbia

Richard B. Mather

University of Minnesota

Mokusen Miyuki

Jung Institute, Zurich

Joseph Needham

Cambridge University

Kristofer M. Schipper

École Française d'Extrême Orient

Anna Seidel

University of Munich

Nathan Sivin

Massachusetts Institute of
Technology

Holmes Welch

Harvard University

Arthur F. Wright

Yale University

Ho Peng Yoke

University of Malaya

Rapporteurs

William Doub

University of Washington

Michael Saso, S.J.

University of London

FIRST INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON TAOISM

Villa Serbelloni, Bellagio (Como) Italy

Pre-conference gathering, September 7, 1968

Sponsors: ACLS and Rockefeller Foundation

Chairman: Arthur Wright

Steering committee: Theodore DeBary and Holmes Welch

Time of daily meetings: A.M. 9:30-12:30
P.M. 4:00- 6:30

Meetings will be daily except Wednesday 11 September which is free.

Format of meetings: (the papers of each speaker are to be read prior to assembly.)

- a) ten minutes will be given to the speaker to add to or comment on his paper.
- b) another ten minutes will be given to the appointed commentator to discuss the paper.
- c) the meeting will then be open to general discussion.
- d) the last ten minutes will be reserved to the speaker to summarize his views and answer questions on his paper.
- e) Mr. Eliade is given the "jus speciale" to intervene at any time during the discussion to comment or ask for clarification.
- f) Either the last session or the second last session will be fully devoted to a summary of the conference, and a discussion on the field of Taoism in general.
- g) the rapporteurs will deliver to the conference within 24 hours of each meeting the notes of the discussion, with the approval of the speakers and the chairman.

Comment by each member of the conference on the reasons for and the beginnings of his or her interest in Taoism.

- 1) Miss Seidel: first study at University of Paris under M. Kaltenmark and R. Stein, specializing in Folk-religion, Buddhism, and Taoism. Paper is concerned with the popular religion and the messianic tendency.

- 2) Mr. Eliade: History of religions. Interested in Taoism as a key to understanding China. Special interests in Shamanism, spiritual techniques, changes within society.
- 3) Mr. Link: the transmission of Buddhism from India to China. Buddhism as influenced by Taoism, and vice versa.
- 4) Mr. Graham: Taoist philosophers, especially pre-Han.
- 5) Father Saso: Popular Taoism and folk-religion.
- 6) Mr. Sivin: Chinese Science and thought and its evolution; the chemistry and theory of alchemy and its history.
- 7) Dr. Needham: History of Science and civilization in China. Taoism as the closest associate of the development of science in China.
- 8) Mr. Welch: student of monastic Buddhism, interested in the parallels with monastic Taoism.
- 9) Mr. Ho Peng-yü: Taoism and Chinese science. Sung and Yuan China as the last heyday of Chinese alchemy and the beginning of its decline.
- 10) Mr. Miyuki: Taoist and Buddhist thought; the differences and similarities between Buddhist Zen meditation and the Taoist forms as in the Hui Ming Ching.
- 11) Mr. DeBary: the history of Chinese Thought and its development, especially in Ming dynasty China.
- 12) Mr. Wright: the relation of thought and value systems with patterns of behaviour and the institutions men build for themselves. Having studied something of Confucian and Buddhist history and influence in China, stresses the need to understand something of Taoism.

Not present for the preliminary conference: Mr. Schipper, Mr. Doub, Mr. Mather, and Mr. Kaltenmark.

FIRST INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON TAOISM

Sunday, 8 September, 1968, morning session

Speaker: Mr. Angus Graham

Chairman: Mr. Holmes Welch

Commentator: Mr. Richard Mather

Title of paper: "Chuang Tzu's 'Essay on Making Things Equal'"

Mr. Graham: I want to speak about pre-Han philosophical Taoism. It can be divided into political and individualistic types. Chuang-tzu's Taoism represents the individual who wanted to get away from public affairs and justify a private life. Chang-tzu is perhaps the only pre-Han philosophical text which is not ultimately concerned with the state. Even the Sophists were concerned with the state in their opposition to aggressive war and other policies, and they also presented a logical justification for universal love. The first coherent justification of the avoidance of public life was Yang Chu's. His individualism is earlier than Chuang-tzu's, but is known to us only at second-hand. Chuang-tzu tried to mysticize what had previously been little more than a defense of the right of a person to be selfish. Political Taoism, as seen in the Tao-teh Ching, was concerned with the art of ruling and how to run a state without appearing to do so. It was this type of Taoism which influenced the Legalists.

There is not much reason to think that Lao-tzu and Chuang-tzu were thought in the pre-Han period to belong to the same school. In the T'ien-hsia (天下) Chapter of Chuang-tzu, Lao-tzu is treated sympathetically but not classed with Chuang-tzu against the other philosophers. However, there is some reason to view them as cognate; for example, in their treatment of the Tao and wu-wei. The basic point is that they presented a new idea of the Tao itself. Until the fourth century, B.C. the Tao was conceived in moral

terms. In other words, the natural order was considered to be a reflection of the moral and social order, as in Confucianism and Mo-tzu. The idea of the order of nature and events having a logic of their own unrelated to moral or personal ends first appeared in about 300 B.C. This view held that in order to accord with the Tao, one must forget personal and fixed moral goals. In the third century, B.C. this view of the Tao of heaven and earth appeared in Confucianism in Hsün-tzu, but he did not want one to be in accord with the Tao, but rather to be good in spite of it.

Needham connects this conception of the Tao with the beginning of a scientific conception of the world and links it with the later alchemical Taoist activities. I think that there may be a historical connection but that it is not very direct. The idea of Lao-tzu and Chuang-tzu that things spontaneously follow courses of their own, is presented primarily in terms of human affairs.

I think that the connection of Lao-tzu and Chuang-tzu with folk or religious Taoism is not very close. Philosophical Taoism was rather sharply separate even as late as the Three Kingdoms and Six Dynasties periods, as we see in Lieh-tzu, whereas Ko Hung is an example of a separate direction. This philosophical Taoism contrasts with the Taoism of immortality in that the former was reconciled to death and accepted it as quite natural although it did hold that if you live in the proper, unassertive manner then you are more likely to live out your natural term.

Mr. Mather: The connection between philosophical and other types of Taoism is slight, but there is a problem about the divergence of views regarding death. In extending human life, nature was complied with, but was simply hurried up as we see in Sivin's paper where mineral processes which took, for example, a thousand years in nature were performed in a few months.

Sivin: This observation should be credited to Professor Eliade.

Mr. Welch: But those processes which were reduced in time were alchemical.

Mr. Sivin: Yes, they were alchemical processes, but if each man attained his own Tao, then he would live longer than "normal." The "chen jen" (真人) of Chuang-tzu were continuous with the later "hsien jen" (仙人).

Mr. Graham: But not described as immortal.

Mr. Sivin: The concept of the "hsien jen" did not necessarily involve living a long time. Actually it involved dying first. Many things which we think are unnatural turn out within the Chinese world-view to be objectively verifiable.

Mr. Welch: Chuang-tzu meant some as allegories or metaphors; however, they were taken literally by later Taoists.

Mr. Sivin: However, does allegorical or metaphorical value really eliminate other possibilities? It would be hard to show that Chuang-tzu meant nothing more.

Mr. Graham: Chuang-tzu probably would not be concerned to make a sharp distinction between fact and parable.

Mr. Sivin: But later Taoists were not making that sharp distinction either, not because of naiveté.

Mr. Seidel: Physiological Taoism was different from Chuang-tzu because its aim was to reverse the course of nature as is expressed by the term "tien-tao." The aim was to create an embryo within oneself instead of passing one's vital forces on to children. Another difference is that in later Taoist physiology only the yang was valued, and it was considered necessary to eliminate the yin.

Mr. Sivin: In the Pao-p'u tzu, it is said that my span of life is up to me not up to heaven.

Mr. Ho: Are there any passages about alchemy or immortality in the Ch'i-wu lun?

Mr. Graham: Near the end there is the passage, "Forget the years, forget duty."

Mr. de Bary: However, this was different in emphasis from Lao-tzu who thought that one could study the Tao and the self as a way of dealing with the world and conduct of life. These were definite methods for use in a practical way.

Mr. Graham: However, we have the paradox of the first lines of the Tao-teh Ching that even if the book does lay down principles in words it also denies that principles can be laid down in words. On the other side Chuang-tzu might also be said to lay down some principles of action.

Mr. de Bary: Lao-tzu is more practical than Chuang-tzu. Therefore, if you use Chuang-tzu for purposes of comparison with religious Taoism, you should remember that he is not typical of all philosophical Taoism.

Mr. Graham: There is a sense in which the Tao is learned in Chuang-tzu, in the way that the cicada catcher learns to catch them by getting the hang of it without depending on verbal instruction.

Mr. de Bary: The emphasis in Chuang-tzu is to achieve freedom, in which it makes no great difference what the rules are. Lao-tzu has a more specific method, definite rules of conduct and he conforms somewhat. However, both of them fundamentally advocate a conscious reversal of the Tao. Even in Lao-tzu and Chuang-tzu to find yourself you must somehow negate or reverse yourself.

Mr. Graham: In Chuang-tzu there is some talk of going against your desires and it being necessary to break habits. I agree that you can find principles of a sort in Lao-tzu, such as when you watch a thing going up, you wait until you see it begin to come down.

Mr. Link: For Chuang-tzu freedom meant acting through and with the way things are. The reversal type of Taoism is to find out the way things are and go along with them and not get cut off from the natural way. The aim is to become more aware of the natural way.

Miss Seidel: Later Taoism contrasted with Chuang-tzu in that it did not accept his way of going towards death.

Mr. Miyuki: Chapter 1 of the Tao-teh Ching is very important for the nei-tan tradition. There is not an opposition to nature but a being in and of nature. The story in Chuang-tzu about the butcher and his gradual attaining of skill and not needing to sharpen his knife expresses the idea that nature takes its own course. Tao follows nature and nature follows Tao. There is some overlap in Lao-tzu and Chuang-tzu.

Mr. Wright: We should try to separate the different strains concerning Lao-tzu and Chuang-tzu. Lao-tzu was a continuous concern of some people during the Han, but people were not interested in Chuang-tzu until the third and fourth centuries. Therefore, during the development of the practical strains of Taoism Lao-tzu was important and not Chuang-tzu.

Mr. Graham: Yes.

Mr. de Bary: Chuang-tzu says that one must not identify the self with the heart alone but rather he stresses the whole personality. He stresses the whole man and the totality of human experience and does not emphasize

intellectual activity. This kind of thinking provides a link with the Taoism of alchemy and physiological practices.

Mr. Graham: But is there really any necessary connection? One might say that alchemical Taoism is on the side of the intellect in that it is held that a technique discovered by thought could change the course of the spontaneous and natural.

Mr. Sivin: No alchemist said he was making up a new or original idea. It was always something he had learned from a teacher.

Mr. Schipper: It has been postulated here that alchemy, which would also include physiological and psychological techniques, was a later development. However, we do not know and there is no proof that these were later than Lao-tzu and Chuang-tzu. A liturgical tradition, the techniques of the trance, the communication with supernatural beings, and shamanistic practices were not created out of nothing in Han times. We know of the existence of popular religion in south China in the fourth century, B.C. There are echoes of these practices in Chuang-tzu.

Mr. Graham: The Lao-tzu has some passages which are perhaps personal mysticism, but on the whole it is concerned with the ruling of the state.

Mr. Link: Lao-tzu's "ku shen" or "valley spirit" is perhaps mystical. In chapter 15 of Chuang-tzu there are passages about exercises called bird-stretchings, bear-pantings, etc. which appear to reflect what may have been practices inherited from the popular religion of the times; thus, we see that these did not arise from nothing in later times.

Mr. de Bary: The context of Lao Tzu was more social; the context of Chuang Tzu was more individualistic and more concerned with personal emancipation

and the drive for transcendence.

Mr. Graham: The roots of Chuang-tzu in popular practice are very real.

Mr. Schipper: If we look at Chuang-tzu through the eyes of the Taoist adept, we find such references on every page. The theme in Chuang-tzu of faraway countries can be related to the later Taoist theocratic states.

Mr. Graham: Certainly he mentions, for example, the breathing techniques, but the question is the purpose for which he uses them. Is there any reason to believe that he uses such techniques for aims other than the experience of an undifferentiated world of which he writes?

Mr. Sivin: Does it surprise us if he was using the techniques of ecstasy to attain ecstasy?

Mr. Wright: Chuang-tzu was a very brilliant poet and a very sophisticated man. He used familiar things and techniques which he found in his society, but he used them heuristically, and his thought was not formed by folk culture.

Mr. de Bary: Yes, but often men who reach such heights are alienated from their own class, the educated élite. Chuang-tzu emphasized the value of the uneducated.

Mr. Sivin: But meditation was not necessarily an end in itself; in Japan the monk goes out into the world as a priest. Chuang-tzu was very concerned with the techniques of the artisan because there he found the knack of doing things automatically, without needing to think about it.

Mr. Miyuki: Meditation was something which one could really do in daily life. The practice of "opening to the light" was very important in the nei tan tradition. The term "Ch'iao (窈)" was used and meant an opening to the depths and the subsequent becoming one of the inner and outer.

Mr. Needham: What is known about the origin of the idea of immortality, "ch'ang sheng" (長生), and the physiological practices related to this aim?

Mr. Mather: Creel collected statistics which show that in early Chou and increasingly in later Chou there were bronze inscriptions praying for long life.

Mr. Wright: There are no detailed textual sources for religious practices except the Chiu ko (九歌).

Mr. Saso: In the oracle bone inscriptions there was a concern for the fate of the soul after death. There was a strict division of the rites between those intended for ancestors and those intended for spirits such as shang ti. The main purpose of the rites was to pray for the souls of the ancestors and to alleviate illnesses caused by the souls of those ancestors. One was supposed to die at the proper stage when yang was prevalent and not yin.

Mr. Wright: The Dynastic Histories of the Six Dynasties period express a contempt for the aborigines of the South and their custom of digging up the bones of their ancestors and washing them when illness broke out.

Mr. Welch: That is still done in Kuang-tung.

Mr. Schipper: There is also the practice of the second burial in Taiwan. The skeleton is cleaned and put in a big jar in the squatting position, the position of the embryo. The jar is called the "chin tou," like the red bucket that is used to receive the new-born child and that every young bride brings with her in her dowry.

Mr. Sivin: In the article about life and immortality in Han China by Yu Ying-shih in HJAS, he relates how there was much concern about the notion of "ch'ang shou wu chiang" (長壽無疆) in the oracle bone inscriptions,

although these yield information only about the burials of a certain small part of the population. It was said that you could get "ch'ang shou" (長壽), which later meant infinite life, but about the earlier meaning of which we do not know, by having the right relationship with the other world. Long life is granted to you, and all you can do is perform the right rituals. The idea developed later that there could be some intervention on your behalf, and Lao-tzu said that one could accumulate spiritual power (virtus). In late Chou the idea developed of taking natural substances, but they could not take you out of earthly existence as with the developed concept of "immortal" ---only lengthen your earthly life.

Mr. Eliade: Hinduism shows the influence of the aborigines, and in the beginning there was popular religion in India with no texts. It was a wonderful, mystical religion which some scholars think was both mystical and did such things as try to cure sicknesses. Taoism can be viewed the same way. Dr. Mather said that these texts were philosophical and were not related to later mysticism, but, since human creativity is not monolithic, why can't we see them as a whole?

Mr. Schipper: Dr. Graham said that it is difficult to see the relationship between the Lieh-tzu and the Taoist religious practices of the time. However, the probable editor of the Lieh-tzu, Chang Chan (張湛), wrote a treatise on physiological practices which included sexual practices. Thus the same man operated on both levels.

Mr. de Bary: As in the Indian case, there is the question of the different levels of expression. Religious elements were not necessarily absent at earlier periods. Different levels exist in different ways as when the Brahmins conquered a mystical, less rational society, and the two traditions existed in opposition to each other. This can be compared to the conquests by the Chou rulers who identified themselves with heaven and a rational order and conquered

a people who had an earth cult and shamanistic practices.

Mr. Eliade: There are parallels in Mohenjo-daro and Crete where we find some ruins with cult objects, but all the other things known about the civilizations indicate a different, non-cult culture.

Mr. Wright: There is no evidence as to whether or not there were shamanistic cults which were submerged during Chou times. We assume the existence of indigenous folk cults in China from very, very early times, but we cannot differentiate the Chinese and the aboriginal from the common substratum. There are only tiny bits of texts, but there is abundant archeological evidence. Of the so-called higher philosophers, Chuang-tzu was perhaps a town-dweller and the Lao-tzu was perhaps formulated by peripatetic philosophers around the towns. Thus there is no apriority of philosophy.

Mr. de Bary: The studies of Kato suggest that Confucianism and Taoism emerged from the same substratum. The religious aspects of both emphasize weakness, which may reflect an indigenous religious tradition undergoing severe repression and then re-emerging as the dominant or established ideology begins to weaken, and the ruling class loses its self-confidence.

Mr. Schipper: There is some echo of this in Granet's view about the masters of techniques and the recipe-makers who counselled the powerful with their techniques and can be viewed as a kind of sociological class.

Mr. Graham: For the pre-Han philosophers, the term "hsin" (心) is the organ of thought, as we find it in Chuang-tzu and Hsun-tzu. I admit that in Meng-tzu we find the expression "pu tung hsin" (不動心): there was no absolute distinction between the intellectual and the emotional, but in general one thinks with the heart and feels with the bowels in Chinese.

Mr. de Bary: At the beginning of chapter 4 of Meng-tzu, "hsin" is used to include the emotions and what we might call the instinctive self. It was like what we call a gut-reaction.

Mr. Sivin: As early as the first developed psychology the emotions were divided among all the viscera, but this was not necessarily as early as Chuang-tzu. What is most interesting is that this division among the organs of the body was made to correspond with the five elements. See pp. 14-15 of Mr. Graham's paper.

Mr. Graham: We have the problem of whether to emphasize the differences or the similarities between the different kinds of Taoism. Behind the Taoist philosophers there was folk religion; the same is true of the Confucians and other schools: I see no reason to class pre-Han folk religion with Lao-tzu and Chuang-tzu as different kinds of Taoism. Wittgenstein talked about the way we try to look for something common to the different meanings of a word, without seeing that meanings branch out, so that there can be similarities between A and B, B and C, B and D, but none common to A, B, C, and D. Therefore, it is not necessary to look for anything common to the philosophy, folk cults, alchemy, etc. called Taoism, although any one of them will no doubt have common features with at least one of the others.

Mr. Schipper: It is not necessarily true that there is more relationship between Taoism and folk religion than there is between Confucianism and folk religion. If we consider the terms "tao chia" and "tao chiao," we should remember that all the philosophers talked about the Tao. What distinction did Liu Hsiang have in mind when he distinguished the philosophers the way he did? One could approach Taoism in a way that would completely omit the pre-Han philosophers.

Mr. Needham: Wasn't immortality in China material? After "shih chieh (尸解)" didn't you still stay in the world and haunt it forever? Was this material immortality characteristic of China and not of the West?

Mr. Sivin: You didn't necessarily stay in the world, but the "immortal body" was a physical body containing your old personality. Of course, this personality was perfect but it has been perfected before "shih chieh."

FIRST INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON TAOISM

Sunday, 8 September, 1968, afternoon session.

Speaker: Mr. Richard Mather

Chairman: Mr. Theodore DeBary

Commentator: Mr. Arthur Link

Title of paper: "The Controversy over Conformity and Naturalness
during the Six Dynasties."

Mr. Mather: three points suggested for discussion:

1) "conformity" and "non-conformity" pre-supposes nature or "naturalness", and its opposite "unnaturalness." If conformity is equated with the natural, one must decide first what the meaning of nature or "tzu-jan" (自然) is. All that is, is "tzu-jan." Yet according to the theory, disorder precedes order, and order in turn leads to a natural cycle of decay, to unnaturalness springing from disorder. The causes of disorder must then be discussed; whether it arises from "selfish desire" (欲) or "willful action" (forcing one's will against the course of nature) (為). Therefore are we not introducing "evil" in some way, supposing a sort of "original sin" in a Chinese sense leading to disorder vs. conformity to nature?

2) After seeing an article of T'ang Ch'ang-ju (唐長孺) on this subject I should add to the paper that the concept of "Wu" which developed at the beginning of the Wei dynasty was perhaps more a rationalization of the government's inability to control or provide order than a basis for revolutionary change as suggested in my paper. Ho Yen and Wang Pi belong really to the second generation, not the founding period of the Wei. However, I still

feel the concept of "Wu" as a kind of matrix for innovation did exist at the beginning of Wei and was developed by Ho and Wang.

3) An interesting footnote to the study of the Wei and Chin period is the number of recluses who continually refused office, as if "face" were gained by refusing office a number of times before final acceptance. Some responsible officials even supported the recluses in the hills. Would one of the explanations be a sort of salving of conscience for having accepted office rather than being a recluse?

Comment: Mr. Link

1) Note how what seems so highly abstract in the philosophy of Wang Pi and Ho Yen has extremely concrete application in the political realities of the times.

2) How can man, who is a part of "the natural," have disorder? Spontaneity seems to contradict doing what is according to nature and therefore pre-determined. Whence, then, comes disorder; is it that man stands aside from nature and decides as a judge?

3) Is disorder then a calamity in the natural order a correspondence to calamity in the microcosm of man?

Discussion:

Chairman: Mr. Theodore DeBary

Mr. Wright: The revival of Chuang-tzu and Lao-tzu at the end of the 2nd century AD can perhaps be ascribed to the fact that the people at the end of the Han were groping for a new option (to the dying Confucian state), and therefore chose the Tao and the wu-wei principles of naturalness as an alternative. The elite of the nation tried every possible new way--personal freedom, adaptation

of the "Tao" as a new way of life, and so forth. This perhaps proved that there was no possibility of adapting the way of Tao to the governing of the empire.

The problem of the recluse raises several questions, associated with the organic concept of men in society. The recluse or the sage kept at court is a part of the "total plus" of the empire. There is the story of the emperor who wanted to do away with all the recluse sages at court, and was told by a Confucian advisor, "If the history of your reign has no biographies of recluses, how will your reign look to posterity?"

Mr. Graham: Another problem arising from the issue of "nature" and "contrary to nature" is that of the fall of man, a problem which arises in any scheme which supposes the original perfection of man. Is this problem specific as well in Taoism? (the discussion continued on this theme) The Confucian system tends to make a man feel constrained and therefore poses the problem of a "natural" state of man vs. artificial behavior (Graham). The Taoist view of man and his relation to nature is the problem at hand, and demands an answer. Where is man's autonomy, and apartness from nature. The "fall" is a Western idea, not Chinese (Link). The idea of the "fall" in the West is a pitfall to the study of China. The "fall" of the empire in China is related to the cyclical idea in nature. The fall of an empire is associated with the appearance of natural calamities, bad administration, and so forth (Sivin).

Mr. Ho: Recluses seem to have been more numerous in the times of bad emperors who executed scholars. The story of Confucius is applicable here. The sage uses the Yellow River to wash his hat

in when clean, but only to wash his feet when turbulent and muddy. It is therefore a Confucian phenomenon as well as Taoist.

Dr. Needham: There is a sociological interpretation to the fall as well. There is in Taoism a certain spontaneous sense of primitive community, for instance, in a primitive society if a house is to be built, all help, and so forth. The idea of a fall seems to mean the building of a class-differentiated society who rule by force (rather than wu-wei) as contrary to the "classless" society of the golden age of primitive peoples.

Mr. Eliade: The idea of a primitive paradise, followed upon by a fall, is a common phenomenon in early societies. In so many archaic societies there is the myth of the "perfection of the beginning" of men and gods mixed. The explanation of why paradise ended is different, however, from the Christian view in many primitive societies. The fall or the end of the golden age is due to a "stupid" unwilled act by one member of society. Such as the story of the wash-woman who pushed heaven away because she kept bumping her head into it, or the tree which connected men with heaven, but was cut down. In these cases man was not willfully responsible, but simply made a stupid mistake. There is no relation to the Judaeo-Christian tradition of the fall. The fall was not man's fault but a part of the general structure of the universe. (This theme was pursued and found applicable to China, in the sense that the "fall" of an empire is part of a cycle, not entirely man's fault as a part of the structure of the universe; not willed by man but due to his sometimes "stupid" actions; what restores order is the concern both of the Taoist and the Confucian. The question was then raised whether or not the fall of man from a state of primitive paradise can be found in Taoism.)

Wright: The ideas of primitive man and society can be found in the Chuang-tzu, in spite of the fact of its highly sophisticated style. The book of Lovejoy and Boas on Primitive and Related Ideas in Antiquity makes a list of the ideas common to all primitivism, which list checks off perfectly with the ideas of the Chuang-tzu.

Mr. Schipper: The idea of the perfect society and utopia is not only found in the Chuang-tzu, but is close to the ideas of the popular Taoist movements at the end of the Han. It is not the problem of the recluse or the bureaucratic central government where we must look for the answer, but that of the popular, theocratic sub-government. It was not so much a revolt against the central government but the apogee of local rule, run by the people. The institutions of the "fang" 方, the "kung ts'ao" 功曹, the "Chi-chui" 祭酒 of the late Han who governed by local custom ("feng-su"), were the real organs of government, of growth and real power.

Mr. Wright: You are suggesting that the institutions of local government were a natural growth rather than a reaction to Han decline?

Mr. Schipper: Yes; they were already existing, and came into power as the Han declined.

Mr. Wright: In other words the Yellow Turbans did what the Han had ceased to do.

Miss Seidel: Do you not mean that there were two patterns to society; that of the central government and the rural structure? This is spoken of in an article of Rolf Stein, and is like the 80th chapter of the Tao Te Ching. There is a historical argument

to show that the recluses of Han times, or petty officials out of office went to the villages, and were themselves the basis of the popular movement. These recluses were Confucian as well as Taoist.

(The discussion then changed to a point raised by Mr. Graham, to Mr. Mather on whether or not the anarchistic tendencies of the Taoists were anywhere so violent as in the essay by Pao Ching-yen on the Pao-p'u-tzu, holding that imperial institutions were "in se" evil. Mr. Mather replied that it was difficult to class any of the attacks or any of the people as Taoist. Thus Wang Hsi-chih and T'ao Yuan-ming were said to be connected with the popular Taoist religion, "Wu Tou Mi Tao," but certainly Wang was more the devotee of the Confucian order and T'ao when in office simply did not oppose the Taoists. The discussion continued, in general showing the difficulty of identifying the real "Taoist". Mr. Schipper pointed out the fact that the Empress Dowager Tsu Hsi had the characters "Wu Wei" inscribed over her throne.)

Mr. Eliade then changed the discussion to the important problem of whether or not there was in China, as in India, the case of a recluse who re-entered society to serve therein and still maintained his spiritual, ritualistic, or meditative practises. Much discussion on this point brought out the fact that in official circles, at least, there was no such example that could be brought to mind, though there were certain cases such as Chu-ko Liang or Chang Liang who retained their recluse qualities in office. Government by the principles of Wu Wei was never really allowed to continue for very long, and was dealt a final death blow by

Han Wu-ti (Miss Seidel.) There are examples of officials who leave office to rule themselves by "Wu Wei;" in the ideal, that is, of the "Huang-lao" rule, one can be a recluse and live in society as ruler. Mr. Eliade pointed out that in actual fact the change was only one of realizing that one was free, whether in office or out. But did those in office really live out the "Nei-tan." or the tradition, especially in the Chuang-tzu, that a man can be in any sphere of public life and maintain his independence. Miss Seidel cited the passage in Chuang-tzu where the emperor asks the master (Chuang-tzu) how to rule, and is sent away. The next day he asks how to rule himself, and is given the answer. "Wu-wei" does not mean "no action". (NB. Mr. Graham's paper of the morning had defined the "Wei" of the phrase as "imposing one's will"; the point here then which is assumed is that the government of "Wu Wei" is an action in conformity with the "tzu-jan.")

Mr. Welch: In response to Mr. Eliade's question, it is very difficult to get the Chinese to talk about their interior meditation. It is even hard to get evidence of the externals of meditation. Reading such cases is like reading about private details that one shouldn't talk about. Yet the fact of no accounts does not mean that there were no such practices.

Mr. Schipper: There is no contradiction in being at the court and still being a recluse. The story of Tung-Fang Shuo in the court of Han Wu-ti is an example to the point. He said, "The best place I can be alone is amongst the crowd at the court. What is the use of going to the mountain?" Wu-wei is a ritual action based on absolute conformity with Tzu-jan. The alternatives between the

Confucian ideology and the Taoist attitude could just as well turn out to be the difference between two different cosmologies.

(The discussion continued. Mr. Schipper concluded the discussion with the remark that the sage was an essential to the court. In the concept of "Huang-lao", emperor and sage, the emperor was the one who acts, and the sage the man behind the scenes who was the "brains." Huang-lao are one person, as puppet and puppeteer, medium and operator, shaman and his interpreter; one had to follow the sub-government of the "hsiang-hsia" to make China work....)

Mr. Eliade: The basic question has still not been solved. The solution of the compromise (between retirement and participation in the world) is an important moment in the history of religion; the tantra believers decided not to retire from the world, but to conquer the world by living in it...a "free man living in the world and practising his beliefs."

Fr. Saso: Perhaps the Taoist priest in the villages of China is the closest to the sample from India. Living his practises of Taoist meditation, at the call night and day of the common man to perform the ritual, he at the same time lives in the world, free from its grandeur and allurements, and conquers by his very "public retirement."

Mr. Mather then summarized his views of the proceedings, re-stressing the difficulty of classifying conformists and non-conformists as either Taoist or Confucian.

FIRST INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON TAOISM

9th of September, 1968; Morning Session

Speaker: Mr. Arthur Link

Chairman: Mr. Arthur F. Wright

Commentator: Mr. Mokusen Miyuki

Topic of the paper: "The Taoist Antecedents of Tao-an's Prajñā Ontology"

Mr. Link: I have tried to follow the type of conceptual pattern I call Taoist antecedents, which play an important role in the development of Tao-an's 道安 (312-385 A.D.) concept of Prajñā. I have tried to follow the history of the idea of pen-wu (本無) through Tao-an's writings and certain Taoist sources, among them the Lao-tzu commentary of Wang Pi, which Tao-an must have read. His concept of pen-wu seems to be an original state of primordial latency or potentiality which, on the one hand, was temporal and on the other was mystical. It was the dialectical opposite of existence and was used as a means to deal with svabhāva-śūnyatā, which is stressed in the Prajñāpāramitā. In these works of Tao-an there is a kind of organic pattern called pen-mo (本末). In this conceptual pattern Pen corresponds to wu (無) in one of its meanings, i.e., the indeterminate, the latent, and the potential. Mo, the "branches", is the proliferation of existence. This is a pattern which is cyclical in that the tree grows, as it were, out of the unmanifested (wu), and its branches (mo, corresponds to yu 有) form the cosmos. I haven't yet traced this through earlier literature. The pen-mo pattern is an archetype and lies unchallenged in the culture until the external challenge of Buddhism when it was reinterpreted in one of its expressions as pen-wu.

Mr. Miyuki: Professor Yuki Reimon 結城令聞 postulated that "Chinese " Buddhism had been formulated in the Sui and T'ang, and this was based on Tathāgatagarbha Pratityasamutpāda 真如緣起, in which you find the ontological notion of tathatā, (真如), from which the development of the universe took place as in the Lao Tzu. From the time of Tao-an Chinese Buddhism tried to digest Buddhist ideas from India into the Chinese cultural pattern. Archetypal patterns first appeared in Hsüan-hsüeh (玄學) or Neo-Taoism which was based on Chuang Tzu, Lao Tzu, and the I Ching. Pen and wu are found separately in the Lao Tzu but not together.

Mr. Link: The term pen-wu first occurs in the Lokahṣema translation (see n. 10 of the paper) as a translation of tathatā ("suchness").

Mr. Ho: Śūnya is used to represent 0 in mathematics.

Mr. Link: The Sanskrit root of śūnya means something hollow, doesn't it?

Mr. Sivin: There is a constant distinction between k'ung (空) and wu (無) in Taoist writings.

Mr. Link: K'ung does not seem to occur often in early Taoist writings, but it does occur in later Buddhist writings.

Mr. Graham: Hsü (虛) is used in Taoist writings to express a similar idea. It seems to mean, thin, rarefied, or tenuous and to be the opposite of shih (實). I am not sure that there was an actual, conscious distinction between pen-wu and actual absence, as Mr. Link supposes in his interpretation of the passage on p. 15 of his paper, much of which is a paraphrase of the Kuo Hsiang commentary to Chuang Tzu.

Mr. Link: Tao-an made use of this and characterized wu in ways which were not Taoist.

Mr. Graham: The "empty openness within a hollow" mentioned on p. 15 of the paper is not distinguished from pen-wu. It is not that nothing generates things but that things generate themselves by means of a

spontaneous, continuous process. We feel that pen-wu must be more than just nothingness, but is this feeling due to our point of view? Should we think of it as anterior in time? On the contrary, they seemed to think of it as a continual generation, and thus pen-wu could be nothing and things could generate themselves out of it. Are we imposing our own traditions of thought here?

Mr. Link: From the Buddhist point of view wu and yu depend on each other equally. For the Taoists wu is a state of potentiality, but for the Buddhists both states were empty. For the Taoists in the earlier period wu in one of its senses seems to imply an absence of particularity.

Mr. deBary: Perhaps the confusion is in the Chinese tradition and not in our imposition of Western ideas. In Tao-an's mind he may have confused different notions from the Chinese classical tradition. Especially wu in the I Ching is different from pen-wu in other contexts. In the I things are continually generated out of the undifferentiated Tao, and no judgment is made as to one being real and the other not. However, in Taoism multiplicity which comes from original unity is sometimes in some way inferior. In Confucianism pen is decidedly superior, and mo is a corruption or degeneration.

Mr. Link: For Tao-an pen (i.e. wu) is a lack of particularity and is unconditioned and is no less real than mo (i.e. yu) and vice versa.

Mr. deBary: On pp. 23-4 it is said that it is necessary to get in touch with or return to the original source of being to restore the branch or mo. This is a rather Confucian notion, and according to this mo is a partial, limited thing.

Mr. Link: This is very common in Taoist texts as in the passages about returning to the origin in the Tao Te Ching.

Mr. deBary: However, in later texts two different views appear, and sometimes there is confusion as we see near the bottom of p. 18 in the

passage, "For these Buddho-Taoists.....". Chuang Tzu and the Hsi Tz'u Appendix of the I Ching affirmed the reality of the concrete and emphasized regeneration rather than degeneration.

Mr. Graham: If we say wu or pen is more "real" we impose our ideas.

Mr. Link: Tao-an's ideas came from a conjunction of Taoist and Buddhist influences, and wu is also a Taoist idea. Perhaps we ought to say that yu (as representing a limited finite thing) is more discrete and concrete. The idea in the Taoist texts of reaching an apex and then returning is growth in a way. We should be careful to try not to clarify more than the clarity of the texts allow. Pen-mo in one of its meanings represents a temporal sequence, and is a process of a root arising from the unmanifest. Also, pen is a source within oneself, it is central and contains everything, and it is not temporal. This is a kind of mystical approach and was Tao-an's approach. Thus there are many different shades of meaning in the Buddho-Taoist usage of the term.

Mr. Sivin: We must have a much clearer idea than we now have of what for a Chinese constituted nothing or non-being and what constituted materiality -- as in the case of ch'i (氣) in which a very broad range of meanings are included. In Western thought before Plato, things were brought to a head when Parmenides opposed the Pythagoreans by asserting that something or being could not be created out of nothing or non-being. The confusion that he was attacking does not seem to have been important in early Chinese philosophy. The ideas that keep wu from being nothing or non-being are ingrained early in the popular Chinese world-view. The "first law of Chinese physics" is that any maximal state of variable is inherently unstable. The pure undifferentiation of the original state thus breaks down to form a state of perfect polarization into yin and yang, which, itself unstable,

breaks up to engender the phenomenal world. In relation to the meaning of the term t'ao-hua (陶化) on p. 19 of the paper, we might note that the term tsao hua (造化) has been frequently mis-translated. I translate it "shaping forces", because tsao means "fabrication", not "creation".

Mr. Graham: In the Kuo Hsiang commentary there are passages which say that something was created out of nothing.

Mr. Sivin: Yes, but by that time there are aspects of philosophy which no longer affect physics. Also, what I have said does not apply past the end of the Han when Indian and Buddhist influence reflected a different order of reality.

Mr. Graham: But the Buddhist influence in philosophy seems to be a little later than Wang Pi and Kuo Hsiang.

Mr. Sivin: I used to feel that way too, but it looks as if, for instance, Greek medical ideas had entered China via India before the end of the Han. Also, I think we can't know what Wang Pi meant by wu, because we use our own notions to explain what he said. A similar case is that it is very confusing to speak of tzu-jan (自然) as "nature".

Mr. Wright: However, Lovejoy has given almost 30 different meanings of the idea of nature in the Western tradition, and I think we could select at least one of them for tzu-jan.

Mr. Link: In the term tzu-jan, the tzu, as Karlgren has shown, is reflexive, so that the term implies that which is the "self-so", i.e. what is complete in end of itself.

Mr. Sivin: The translation "self-so" does justice to it as a state, but we must view it as a connected series of states and as a kind of action.

Fr. Saso: In Aristotle's answer to Parmenides, he said that creation

does not take place from nothing but that it is eternal and always happening. The answer of Taoism is of course not the same but not altogether different from that of Aristotle. The "Ch'ang-tao" (常道) is in a sense always producing the two, the two the three, and from the three the ten thousand things. Therefore the problem of "creatio ex nihilo" (being neither the notion of particles refuted by Parmenides nor the "unmoved mover" of Aristotle) need not solve the Greek problem of creation. The "Wu" is in a sense the "one" which is unmoved and eternally producing all things. Also the problem came up yesterday of the "notion of evil" with the Chinese; here the Indian idea of "nothingness" as perfection and "being" as a sort of imperfection is it seems to me quite different from that of the Chinese. I think that there is no sense of original sin or evilness of nature at all with the Chinese. Rather than "personal" guilt there is "social" faults for having deviated in some way from the "tzu-jan", or offended social virtue, or having not attended to their ancestors.

The ritual also shows, in the fen teng (分燈), I believe, the progression from the one to the two to the three and from there to the ten thousand things (wan wu 萬物), as we find in the passage in the Tao Te Ching.

Miss Seidel: The ch'ang tao (常道) can't be named. Only the wang tao (王道) or way of the ruler can be named.

Mr. Miyuki: In Buddhist texts the term "sheng" is often used (生). Is this true of Taoism as well?

Fr. Saso: I believe that in the Yü Shu Pao Ching, which is in the 25th volume of the Tao Tsang, (the Taoist equivalent of the Chin-kang Ching) it is said that the highest deity of the ninth heaven "speaks" and that the sound (sheng 聲) gives birth (sheng 生). This text is used on the first day of Taoist ritual.

Mr. deBary: The time of Tao-an seemed to be a special point in time when it seemed to be necessary to convert Buddhism into something Chinese. This process brought out the elements in Chinese tradition which were congenial to Buddhism. The more normal Chinese view can perhaps be seen in later Ch'an where the actual and the concrete were reaffirmed.

Mr. Wright: Let's discuss the Taoist or neo-Taoist ideas which Tao-an drew on and assimilated such as pen-mo (本末) and t'i-yung (體用).

Mr. Graham: The concept of yüan-liu (源流) was also among them. The notion of t'i and yung may have been purely Taoist, although it is sometimes supposed to come from Buddhism.

Mr. Miyuki: Chan Wing-tsit attributes the notion of t'i and yung to Wang pi. A similar idea also appears in the Chou i ts'an t'ung ch'i (周易參同契).

Mr. Sivin: However, the date of the extant text of the Chou i ts'an t'ung ch'i is very uncertain.

Mr. Miyuki: Many of the earliest Buddhist texts translated in China were meditation texts. On p. 21 of the paper there seems to be a reference to Taoist meditation.

Mr. Link: During Tao-an's time there were those who had the aim of blanking out dichotomies. Tao-an said that the essence of the Prajñāpāramitā was that there is no personal bias and no differentiation. Tao-an and others of his time were not interested in ontology per se but were interested in inner, mystical experience.

In the Buddhist view, for a thing to be ultimately existent, it must exist in and of itself, and the Chinese notion of tzu-jan seemed to fulfill some of these ideas.

Mr. deBary: Tao-an was trying to understand Buddhist views. We have some advantage since we can see these attempts as a continuing process,

and we don't assume that there was some fixed truth he had to get.

Mr. Link: The later translations by Hsüan-tsang and others were more correct in that they reproduced the content of the Indian originals more accurately. However, to the Chinese mind they were non-generative and not appealing.

Mr. Eliade: There were parallels in India to the Taoist notion of returning to the source (see p. 32 of the paper). In the Middle Ages in India Goratnat (?), the mythical founder of Hathayoga (?), applied a similar technique, the aim of which was to recreate a divine or supreme, perfect body and achieve immortality. The technique was called ultra-sadhana (literally, "going against the hair"), and was a process of going back in time through ones many existences to the very beginning and thus burning away the karmic accumulation. Their aim of bodily immortality was very contrary to most Indian tradition. They also used techniques of breath control, mystical physiology and retention of the semen which are very similar to those used by the Taoists. They also used alchemy which was similar to but not identical to the Chinese.

Mr. Sivin: Filliozat and van Gulik thought that there was a complex diffusion of alchemy and physiological techniques between China and India, which were in continuous contact.

FIRST INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON TAOISM

Sunday, September 12, 1968, afternoon session

Speaker: Mr. Kristofer Schipper

Chairman: Mr. W. T. de Bary

Commentator: Mr. Mircea Eliade

Title of Paper: "Taoism: the Liturgical Tradition"

Mr. Schipper: The aim of this paper is to describe the liturgy of what I consider the main stream of Taoism. The description of the "chiao" (醮) is too abbreviated. I have given a much longer description of the chiao (醮) in my thesis (for reference, see p. 76, n. 130 of the paper).

Mr. Eliade: The description of the "Red Head" (see especially p. 3) is very interesting and strange. Usually one finds an opposition of the ecstatic and the secular, but here we have a kind of secular priest. The Red Head is constantly related to the spirits, and yet he himself is not possessed. He is also the performer in the string-puppet theatre and the image of the spirit which controls the man. There are parallels to this in India where the man who controls the puppet is thought of as Brahma himself. However, here in Taoism the Red Head plays the role of a purely rationalistic Brahma-Atman type; therefore, this medium creates something new. Here, rather than a tension between a medium and a priest, there is a tension between the Red Head and secular elements.

The initiation of the Red Head is also quite interesting. The climbing of a ladder of thirty-six swords (see p. 4) is similar to shaman traditions, but it is ambivalent and not the same because he does not behave like a shaman. Rather, the priests whirl through the temple singing out what they see in their glorious visit to Heaven (see p. 36). Also, the acrobatics

and the playing of the drum are ecstatic. Thus the priests are not ecstatic at the beginning, and at the end they are.

The different functions of the priests seem to be an open question. I would like to know more about the initiation of the priests. The "chai-kuan" (齋官) consider their function to be representing the Tao (see pp. 7-8). We find a tension between those who do the sacrifices and the shamans. The fact that when the priests gesture they are also meditating at the same time (see p. 22) is important because proofs of this are rare. Since his robe really is a map of the universe (see p. 14), the priest is a divine mediator. Is the priest here symbolizing the world or is he in the center of it?

Mr. Schipper: Both.

Mr. Eliade: Does he represent the emperor?

Mr. Schipper: Yes. We also see here the origin of the emperor.

Mr. Eliade: When he is in the Sacred Area (t'an 壇), the priest only executes certain steps, and he is the "wooden priest" (chai-kao-kung) while the acolytes move. There are parallels to this in Brahmanic practices; however, there if an acolyte makes a mistake, the high priest intervenes to save the sacrifice. I was also very interested in the uses of the flame of the incense burner and the petition (fu-chang 伏章) described on p. 23.

Mr. Schipper: When the ritual begins, the priest does not wear this head-dress with the flame on it. Only when this part of the ceremony involving the lighting of the flame, which is the most ancient part of the ritual, is over does the priest put the petition in. There are documents about this part of the ritual which constitute a kind of catechism.

Mr. Eliade: I was very interested in the symbolism (see p. 34) of the incense burner, which was in the form of a miniature mountain, had clouds on it which came from the paradise of the immortals, and had associations with the "far journeys" (yüan yu 遠遊). The lighting and extinguishing of fires and lamps are very universal symbols for the creation of the world. The process of reintegration (see pp. 30-31) has parallels in Tibet and Iran. Among them are that demons appear even in the newly recreated world.

Mr. Schipper: The theme of this paper is to distinguish what for Sinologists have until now been two undifferentiated spheres, namely Taoism and folk-religion. There are two different kinds of priesthoods. One of these is what is ordinarily called "tao-chiao" (道教). It has an orthodox tradition, a canon and ritual done in Classical Chinese, a priesthood which is hereditary and bureaucratic, and is recognized by the government. The other kind is usually called "shen-chiao" (神教). On the higher level of tao-chiao, there were originally six people involved in the liturgy. Two of them were the high priest, the so-called "wooden priest," and his mouth-piece, who actually intones the hymns, prayers, etc. (see pp. 10-11).

You ask to what extent the liturgy is ecstatic. I know a man who when doing the ritual and meditating had his hair stand on end.

A "chiao" essentially is a rite of the renewal of life. It is necessary for a community to do this once each generation. For one hundred days before the chiao, the community is nearly dead. Only vegetarian food is eaten, there are no sexual relations, and representatives of the community are locked up with the priests. After the chiao is completed there is a huge communion, and ming (命) (fate, life-expectancy) is thus renewed. It is believed that there will be no deaths for one year after the chiao.

Mr. Eliade: What is the "immortal embryo"? (see p. 37)

Mr. Schipper: My use of the term is poetic license. I was trying to show that Taoism is fundamentally one. Often alchemy scorns any connection with communal and liturgical Taoism, but, as we can see from the universality of this image of the embryo, the core of the liturgy is essentially the same as what prevails in the alchemical tradition.

Mr. Welch: To what extent are your descriptions the way things are actually done? Or have you described the way they are supposed to be done or the way they were done? Also, where were they done?

Mr. Schipper: Unless otherwise specified, the content of this paper is all based on field observations in T'ai-nan City (台南) and the immediate vicinity. For a half a year I was foreign secretary to the sixty-third Chang t'ien shih (張天師). This tradition dates only from the Sung and is much simpler than what is described here. The chiao seems to be the commonest expression of communal religion. According to people I've talked to it was fairly common in South China. Father Saso has found some forty-odd liturgical manuscripts in the British Museum which date from the Yung-chen period. There are many extant liturgical memorials by statesmen such as Ou-yang Hsiu for chiao which mentioned the emperor. Nearly all the late T'ang and Sung literati wrote them.

Mr. Wright: When you try to find similarities with the Taoism of Chang Tao-ling (張道陵) and the beginnings of religious Taoism, all you have are some similar terms.

Mr. Schipper: There are also names of offices and of officials such as "san wu^{tu} kung" (三五都功) and "cheng i mang ch'eng" (正一盟成) which appear in histories which deal with the second century A.D. There is

also a theory about the term "wu tou mi" (五斗米). In Taoist liturgy five bushels are used to establish a microcosm. The five bushels as they are used nowadays are related to the "wu chen wen" (五真文) ("the five real writs"). There are some very few documents about this, but some information can be found in the histories of the Ling-pao (靈寶) tradition, one of the oldest of which is the Wu fu Ling-pao (五符靈寶), which is ascribed by Fukui Kojun to Ko Hung's (葛洪) grandson. However, as I just mentioned, we have evidence from the liturgy that the wu chen wen corresponded to the wu tou mi. The five talisman (fu 符) and five bushels of rice (wu tou mi) are actually still used in the liturgy.

Mr. de Bary: Do these things appear to be the oldest culture of these people which they've held on to, or are they in the backwash and just being the most conservative?

Mr. Schipper: This very sophisticated ritual of the Taoist church is not the oldest one. The shen-ming (神明) is much older as part of purer folk-religion. However, all aspects of the rituals of the Taoist church are related to the imperial-Legalist establishment. It is important that as soon as there was an empire there was an enormous amount of paper work involved such as supplications, passports, and many others, and many of these have their counterparts in Taoism. The actual evidence we have that this Taoist set-up played a part in imperial administration dates only from the Sung.

Mr. Sivin: What is the relationship between this Taoist establishment and the Nationalist government?

Mr. Schipper: If you ask a present-day tao-shih (道士) if the government of the Kuo Min Tang is good, they say no because there is no emperor. This is because the Taoists are basically imperial and legalist.

Mr. de Bary: What kind of relationship did they have with the Japanese during the occupation?

(NOTE: Mr. Schipper spoke at this point, but for some reason I did not get down what he said. Unfortunately, this makes the next passage difficult to understand.

Rapporteur)

Mr. Wright: There are other reasons. T'aiwan was incorporated into the Chinese empire rather late, and in the early years people were engaged in pushing back the aborigines and building things; therefore, they did not have an elite to push these things out.

Mr. Schipper: That's probably not so. In northern T'aiwan these rituals are scarcer, because the North was settled later. Most of the T'ainan people came from the Mainland as members of families. The "hung-t'ou" (紅頭) ("Red Heads"), puppet players, and such things came only after T'aiwan was settled. (Here is another portion I missed. Rapporteur) Some parts of northern T'aiwan never made it. T'ai-pei, Chi-lung, and Hsin-chu just barely made it. When these "hua-ta" went south to be initiated, they were refused, and they then went to the Mainland to the Chang T'ien Shih and stayed as long as two years.

Mr. Welch: The Chang T'ien Shih gets some money from the government now.

Mr. Schipper: The government never got to the tao-shih in T'ai-nan because from Ch'ing times the tao-shih have had a guild which would have nothing to do with the Kuo Min Tang.

Mr. Saso: We need careful textual dating of the ancient books of ritual.

Mr. Schipper: For commentaries one should use the big Sung liturgical compilations as they are easier to use and for the reader to look up. With a great deal of work this liturgical evidence could be linked to the Six Dynasties texts. Many outlines of liturgy in the Tao Tsang are from the Six Dynasties, and some of them are almost word for word.

Mr. Saso: There are parallels in Roman Catholic liturgy.

Mr. Schipper: Yes, for example, the pan tao hui.

Mr. Welch: I would like to call your attention to the following passages:

"The tao-shih are aware of their creed, as they always take off the 'hua,' the flame-shaped diadem, whenever they stand face to face with the shen-ming." (p. 18) "...the priests whirl through the temple, singing out what they see in their glorious visit to Heaven." (p. 36) Do the tao'shih think and feel the things you've said here? What kind of observations about this have you made?

Mr. Schipper: I didn't ask any questions, because I was a disciple. I was instructed. If you ask a question, they rationalize, because what they're doing is what they've been doing since childhood. In this paper I've described only a very small part of the more than one hundred different rites currently practiced in T'aiwan. These tao-shih families are very sophisticated religiously. They are the highest form of religious specialists in popular religion. It takes about twenty years to become a kao-kung, and this is not rationalized.

Mr. Wright: Do the tao-shih enjoy theological discussions?

Mr. Schipper: They never speculate about these meanings, and they do not know about the Tao Tsang. It is not a faith you can be converted to. There is no element of the inquiring mind operating here.

(Here, again, I did not get down clearly enough to reproduce part of what Mr. Schipper said about some of the specific details of the liturgy. Rapporteur.)

Mr. Eliade: Why are there two cosmogonies?

Mr. Schipper: There are three superimposed. The "t'an" (sacred area) is oriented toward the north, and the "wu tou mi" are oriented toward the center.

(I failed to get down the third element or to get down clearly and completely enough the diagram of the sacred area. Rapporteur.)

The interior "t'an" serves as a place to send out messages to Heaven. This is done by going outside and standing on the platform. Then the direction is reversed. The idea of the creation of the world is shown only by the wu tou mi. The head priest represents a microcosm as he stands surrounded by the pa kua. (Many of the details which Mr. Schipper mentioned at this point can be found in the paper, especially pp. 26-32. Rapporteur)

Mr. Sivin: The Mao-shan p'ai (茅山派) people divorced themselves from the active liturgical tradition and went off and "did their own thing." How does the "san chiao kuei i" (三教歸一) movement fit in?

Mr. Schipper: It was on the level of shen-chiao (神教) and was not related to the level of the tao-shih; therefore, it was on the level of folk religion. I will try to make a comparative diagram.

Orthodox

Called "tao-chiao" (道教) and use "t'ien tsun" (天尊).

Uses Classical Chinese (wen yen 文言).

Prominent activities are retreats ("chai" 齋) and the "chiao" (醮).

Hereditary

Recognized by the government.

More involved with the life of the city.

Descended from the Cheng i (正一) School of Han times.

Kuan Kung (關公) is here a "kuei." 鬼

Occurs more in southern China and in southern T'aiwan.

Popular

Called "shen-chiao" (神教) and uses the "shen-ming" (神明).

Uses Colloquial Chinese (pai hua 白話).

Prominent practices include the summoning of the shen (ch'ing shen 請神) and the use of mediumistic practices such as auto-writing (using the fu luan 扶鸞) and the spirit-lad.

Vocational.

More involved with the secret societies.

More involved with the life of the countryside.

Descended from and associated with the Mao-shan Sect, which in T'ang times became the most important monastic group prior to the Ch'uan-chen (全真) Sect and did ritual for the community.

Kuan Kung is here a "shen" (神).

Occurs more in northern China and northern T'aiwan.

More associated with revolutions and rebellions.

There are correlations between the messianic movements and the secret societies, but there is a great difference between such phenomena as these and the community establishment of the Cheng i Sect, which imitated the government. Also, there was opposition in the later Han between the T'ai-p'ing tao (太平道) and the T'ien-shih chiao (天師教).

Miss Seidel: During the Three Kingdoms period, the tao-shih acted like Confucian magistrates. They reacted to "lower" cults the way magistrates did. There were similarities in the Mao-shan Sect which claimed that you could be rescued from the kinds of spirits who made you sick if you did not sacrifice to them if you joined their sect. The cult to Li Hung, which emerged some three centuries after he was supposed to have lived, was rather Confucian.

Mr. Wright: Where do you place the cult of wu yüeh shan (五嶽山)?

Mr. Schipper: That is very difficult. It is classical culture and should probably be placed somewhere above both. All the different divisions communicate in this. (See Mr. Schipper's article, "五嶽真形圖の信仰 (Le Wou-yue tchen-hing-t'ou et son culte)" (in Japanese), Dokyo Kenkyu (道教研究), Vol. II. Tokyo: Shōshinsha (昭森社), 1967, pp. 114-162.

Mr. Sivin: If I'm right, revolution fits in the "Popular" column, and the popular elite were the Red Hats (hung-t'ou 紅頭). Was it always this way or not?

Mr. Schipper: The orthodox liturgical tradition has something to show as to continuity.

Mr. Needham: On behalf of the wai tan chiao (外丹教), I am very interested in the incense burner ("hsiang lu" 香爐). It is probably related to the alchemist's stove, the fumigation of dwellings, and medicine. I also find the ecstatic aspect and the use of hemp very interesting. It is also possible that it is related to the early use of toxic smoke in Chinese military arts and the invention of gunpowder in the eighth century A.D. using sulfur and nitrate compounds. Incense sticks were used in keeping watches at sea.

Mr. Sivin: I have investigated a text on the clepsydra which shows that it was used by the Mao-shan Sect to keep time for meditation.

Mr. Schipper: We need to stimulate research in this field.

FIRST INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON TAOISM

9th of September, 1968; Afternoon Session

Speaker: Miss Anna Seidel

Chairman: Mr. Holmes Welch

Commentator: Mr. Arthur Wright

Topic of the paper: "The Image of the Perfect Ruler in Early Taoist Messianism."

Miss Seidel: Being a beginner in the study of Taoism, I owe my presence at this conference exclusively to the kindness of Professor Helmut Wilhelm whose attendance at this meeting is deeply missed by all here.

In the paper I have followed up one of the questions which grew out of my thesis, on "The Deification of Lao-tzu." The Lao-tzu who was deified in the Huang-lao current in Han times was not the mystic recluse, but the figure of the sagely advisor of the emperor. As Mr. Graham point out yesterday, the Tao-te Ching can be considered a political guide book; Mr. Schipper then pointed out that the two patriarchs of the Huang-lao school were the ideal emperor "Huang-ti" 黃帝 and the sage par excellence "Lao-tzu" 老子. On this assumption it would be quite logical to find in the messianic currents of the Six Dynasties the development of the vision of the sage on the throne in connection with the Lao-tzu cult. However, as I tried to show in the paper, things are more complicated in reality, and the relationship between the sage Lao-tzu and the different messianic figures is far from clear.

There are four open questions which I would like to suggest for discussion:

- 1) The messianic movements predicting again and again the

coming of a leader named Li Hung 李弘 seemed to have evolved outside if not in opposition to the Wu-tou-mi-tao (Five Bushels of Rice 五斗米道) church; this is clear especially in the case of K'ou Ch'ien-chih's sect, and is confirmed perhaps in the fact that there is no text from the Celestial Masters' tradition 張天師 that I have been able to find yet which mentions Li Hung. If they touch on the topic at all, they speak of the Holy Lord Li, emissary of Lao-chün (without the name of "Hung"). What I want to say is that I did not find a social group propogating this messianism throughout the Six Dynasties.

It might have been an organized sect, the Li Chia Tao (李家道) from Szuchwan; it might have been merely a latent element of the Lao-tzu cult revived at periods of political crisis--in any case it points to the existence of popular movements resembling more closely the modern "Red-hat" Taoists than the "Black-hat" priests. In later texts there are, in connection with this messianism, even some indications of a cult to a supreme female deity, the mother of Lao-tzu, "太一元君", evidence which points to a secret society type movement.

2) Another question concerns the possible ritual background of this messianism. I have somewhat neglected the overall importance of charms in most messianic texts, in fact the sutras themselves (e.g. 神呪經) are sometimes considered the indispensable equipment for the adepts reaching the "T'ai P'ing (太平)". Perhaps a search for possibly existing rituals of the transmission of these texts and charms (fu 符 or lu 籙) could give us some idea if or how these expectations of the T'ai P'ing (太平) ruler took shape in the Taoist community.

3) Another point I would like to mention is that there are almost as many rebel leaders named "Liu" (劉) as there are named "Li" (李). Their religious relevance I do not know, but it seems that this messianism kept alive a nostalgia for the political unity of the vanished Han Empire. The prophecy can be traced from Wang Mang to the founding of the T'ang Dynasty, from the Li family's claim to be the coadjutors of the Han Emperors, right down to the pretended descendant of Lao-tzu, Li Yuan, the first T'ang emperor. The heavenly mandate for a virtuous ruler of the whole of China was concern of the Taoist religion.

4) My last question is, how are we to imagine this messianic T'ai P'ing (太平) empire in a system of thought which knows no linear time, no end of history, no eschatology. Does it enter into the pattern of a normal dynasty, good at the beginning but doomed to inevitable decline and eventual replacement by another dynasty? I don't think this is the case, because in the T'ai P'ing empire the religious and the political organizations coincided; in other words the terrestrial bureaucratic state was fused with Taoist heavens which are, as we all know, but a replica of this same bureaucratic state. This might have something to do with the fact that the perfect state eventually became a Utopia, namely the heaven of the chosen people, governed by a heavenly emperor of the "Golden Gate", the lord of the "T'ai P'ing" with the family-name Li, who was no longer expected to appear in history.

Mr. Wright: as commentator on the paper, then explained with a diagram on the board the parallel course of the "Great Tradition" and the "Little Tradition" showing that at times their course ran parallel, and at other times they had direct influence on one another. The middle men between the two traditions were the shaman,

the wonder worker, the oracle, and the poet, who moved between both orders. Thus the poetry of Li Po was sung by the people, and Po Chü-i went to the people for the themes of his poems, drawing from the little tradition. Miss Seidel's paper shows how the little tradition came near to taking over the great tradition, and the close relation that sometimes existed between the two. The model then provides a way of talking about the two traditions. Mr. Wright praised the content of Miss Seidel's paper, pointing out five themes for possible discussion.

1) The choice of words to describe the movement: messianism, milleniarism, "Huang T'ien" (黃天) as a total new order succeeding the past, cyclical ideals vs. millennial ones.

2) An echo of Mencius can be seen in the heavenly minister who works at the court, accumulates "te" (virtue 德) and attracts the loyalty of the people, until he succeeds to the mandate of heaven.

3) The predecessors of the T'ai P'ing impinged on all sorts of sacerdotal functions reserved to Han Confucian emperors. The Han rulers too claimed T'ai P'ing powers.

4) A functional approach to the T'ai P'ing's: a religious movement turns to providing maintenance and order, building bridges and roads; Lao-tzu and his surrogates become the rallying point for the disaffected, providing two developments: 1) an organized challenge to the decaying Han; and 2) a compromise with the new developing order when Chang Lu submits to Ts'ao Ts'ao, originating from the messianic Lao-chün ideal.

5) The hopes of the T'ai P'ing persisted in the underground movements of the Six Dynasties, changing from the dual character of ruler and sage disciple, the messianic utopian ideal, to an emissary from heaven instead, chastizing the wicked on earth from heaven.

The famous Taoist master of the northern Wei, K'ou Ch'ien-chih, tried to drive out the Buddhists and deprive them of their power, at the same time developing a state Taoism. But the big and the little tradition together knocked him down; Buddhism and Confucianism appealed to the elite, and tamed Taoism failed to appeal to the people. Mr. Wright concluded by saying that he regretted the sad ending of the paper with the execution of Li Hung.

Miss Seidel answered the comment of Mr. Wright by saying that the term Millennialism fitted even less than the term messianism, since it was rather a good ruler image than a 1,000 year golden age concept. Perhaps the western term "Messiah" fitted the case better. Also it must be noted that although Lao-tzu became a god, the image of him as messiah varied with social classes. The Mao Shan sect of Taoism never believed in the messiah image, which was only to be found among the villages and the peasants. For the elite, Lao-tzu was a god of the "Nei-tan", and "Huang-Lao" the emperor-sage. Curiously enough, Lao-tzu's title "Huang-lao Chün" (黃老君) is not to be found in the messianic texts, but in the physiological texts as the Huang T'ing Ching (黃庭經).

Mr. Schipper then led off the discussion by posing the following problems: 1) the nine stages or transformations Lao-tzu goes through and its relation to alchemy; 2) the importance of a female deity in initiation ritual, through heavenly banquet and marriage, associated with the festival of the seventh day seventh month; and the founding of the Mao Shan P'ai through the revelation of a female deity. 3) the difficulty of dating the Hsiang Er (想爾注), which is an extremely early document, associated with Chang Tao-ling, and which gives an early proof of the T'ai Shang Lao-chün (太上老君).

cult; 4) the meaning and significance of the name "Li Hung" (李弘) where Hung has the cognate meaning of "red" (紅). The name itself reveals its messianic content, the link with secret societies, and perhaps represented in the "Red hat" (紅頭) Taoists, and medium-spirit writing, the most common characteristics of secret societies even today; 5) a request that Miss Seidel elaborate further on the problem of Chin Ch'üeh Ti Chün (金闕帝君) and Chin Ch'üeh Lao-chün (金闕老君), the problem of identifying Shang Ti (上帝) and the earliest association of Shang-ti with Yü Huang Shang-ti (玉皇上帝). 6) Taiwan as an amazing reliquary for the study of folk-religion, especially the so called "red hat" (紅頭) sect of Taoism. These Taoist priests claim Hsü Chia Jen as their founder (徐甲人) and go by the name Li Lao-chün P'ai (李老君派). Hsü Chia Chen-jen (徐甲真人) was the skeleton whom Lao-tzu found on his way to the Western Pass, whom Lao-tzu made into a person, and who is essential to the themes of Taoist hagiography. It is seen also in the story of Chiu Ch'ang-ch'ün (邱長春) who revives a whole field of bones on his travels from Mongolia (of Waley's Travels of a Chinese Alchemist.)

Mr. Ho then recalled the story of Huang-shih kung (黃石公) whom Chang Liang met at the bridge; a story connected with the founding of Taoism. Mr. Schipper agreed, and added that Lao-tzu too was the mentor of Chang Tao-ling, the founder of the Wu Tou Mi Tao sect. Miss Seidel then recalled the gradual transformation of Lao-tzu during the Han from Huang-ti (黃帝) the emperor with Lao-tzu as his sagely advisor, to the take over of Lao-tzu as both figures in one. At a request from Dr. Needham, Miss Seidel then attempted to trace the book Lao-tzu Pien-hua Ching (變化經) from the end of the Han (ca. 220 AD) to its final re-copy in 612, at the beginning

of the T'ang dynasty, in Ch'ang-an. Mr. Link asked where the term "Pien Hua" first appeared in connection with Lao-tzu, and Miss Seidel recalled that it was in the Kuan-tzu.

Mr. Sivin interposed with the suggestion that it was difficult to date a text such as the Pien-hua Ching simply from the condition of the text. He then asked what the "absence of linear time" might mean in the context of the messianic tradition. Miss Seidel replied that the people of the time actually believed in the appearance of a messiah who would establish a "heaven-earth" sort of reign, not cyclical as was the "imperial" time. Mr. Sivin agreed that the concepts of time were indeed different*. The discussion then changed to the use of the term "Ti" or emperor and "Wang" or king by different messianic rebels. Mr. Link asked if the use of the term "Ti" meant pretensions to the throne, and Miss Seidel answered that in the messianic texts, "Wang" was usual, whereas in the rebellions of the late Han, the leaders preferred the title "Ti" (帝).

Mr. Wright: Does messianism originate only from the lowest stratum of society? Aren't the leaders fallouts from the great tradition? Leadership of the masses is from failed examination candidates, ruined lacquer merchants (Huang Ch'ao of the T'ang) etc.

Miss Seidel: Yes, the leaders of the movements were literate, but they identified themselves with the people who were illiterate and who kept the expectation of a messianic ruler Li Hung alive.

(Tea break)

* Mr. Needham had shown that linear time concepts had been generally associated with messianic Taoism

Part Two:

Mr. Miyuki: As in Buddhism there is a difference in feeling between the notion of "Ju-lai" (如來) and "Fu" (佛). Is there not a parallel in the difference between Lao-tzu and Lao-chün?

Miss Seidel: This is an interesting point, which has not been studied yet. I have used the two terms as they occurred in the text.

Mr. Graham: Yes, it does sound like the Indian terminology of Avatar and Maitreya.

Mr. Wright: According to Stein's article in the T'oung Pao, the Yellow Turbans were influenced by Zoroastrianism, Tibetan Tantrism, Buddhism, the Yao people, and Taoism.

Miss Seidel: There was a definite influence of the aborigines; the Li family of Szechwan were aborigines.

Mr. Welch: What is the first allusion to re-incarnation in Chinese texts, a re-birth after dying?

Mr. Schipper: It depends how one formulates the question, and what is meant by "re-incarnation." Is the Pien-hua Ching not perhaps a case of shamanism? Shamanistic practices where the human body is the host to different spiritual identities? In ancient China the "Shih" (尸) grandson takes the place of the ancestor in the ritual; is this not the kind of re-appearance as in the Huang-lao current?

Mr. Wright: There are parallels in Buddhism with the rebel ideologies here discussed. The rebellions sparked by Buddhist messianism take the same path: one person calls himself "Maitreya", and appoints an emperor in "white" costume, the color of Maitreya. One might draw the conclusion then that the Buddhist rebellions are quite similar to Taoist.

Miss Seidel: There is, however, a difference between the Buddhist reincarnation, and that of Huang-ti and Lao-tzu. The Yellow Emperor is a magician who manufactures nine cauldrons, and by magic ascends to heaven in an apothosis; whereas Lao-tzu's old age is due to wisdom (not magic) and vitality; he stays on earth and comes again and again down from K'un Lun to be the advisor of a good ruler. This is different from the Buddhist concept of an Avatar.

Next the problem of the identity of Yü Huang Shang-ti was raised. Miss Seidel explained how the sacrifice to Huang-ti in early times gradually changed. In the early Han, Huang-ti was worshipped in the center of the altar of heaven. In Han Wu-ti's time the first change occurred when "T'ai-I" was placed in the middle, with the five emperors around him. T'ai-i was seen as the sum of the Tao, the perfect emperor. Then in 166 AD, this same sacrifice (chiao 郊) was offered with Lao-tzu in the center of the altar. In texts of this period "Huang-Lao" can therefore be translated as the "Yellow Lao-tzu".

Mr. Eliade: In the Book of Paul Radin, The Winnebago Tribe, as in the case of many other American Indians, there are clear accounts of a shaman remembering his former lives. The shaman recounts how he came back to life, entered the house, and so forth; these were oral reports taken directly from shamans. Cases of shamanism like this also occur in Greece after the opening of commerce with the Scythians through the Black Sea.

Also, the relation between messianic Taoism and secret societies can be verified by comparative studies. Modern African

messianic movements are all related to secret societies, and the myth of restoration of the past, eschatology.

Finally, it must be noted that the school of Himalayan Yoga as well as some of the Dravidian traditions in South India pretend to restore bodily health, and long life through alchemy. The technique of "returning to one's origin," "going against the hair" (i.e. going against the grain), the mythical "Ultra-sadhana", "pratiloman", as preached by Gorakhnata, founder of the Hathayoga School is also related to the same idea.

FIRST INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON TAOISM

10th of September, 1968, Morning Session

Speaker: Mr. Nathan Sivin

Chairman: Mr. W.T. deBary

Commentator: Mr. Joseph Needham

Topic of the paper: "Reflections on Theory and Practice in Chinese Alchemy"

Mr. Sivin: The pragmatic tradition is much easier to write about than the theoretical because problems can be solved by understanding chemical processes. It is very difficult to date texts, but it is to some extent possible to group texts or make judgments on the basis of the internal style of a text. Any impression in my paper of any chronological priority among such things as wai tan (外丹), nei tan (內丹), fang chung (房中), and ch'i kung (氣功) is specious as such questions are still completely open.

We may define hsien shu (仙術) as all the techniques that make a man an immortal. In its broader sense, nei tan may be defined as any hsien shu which uses the laboratory techniques. In the narrower sense we would confine it to breath techniques. Ch'i kung may be defined as breathing techniques in general.

Mr. Needham: May I first speak of the only aspect of this paper which gives me pause. I agree up to a point with the remark on p. 16, " [the alchemists]....were scientists -- not modern scientists in embryo but men of their time,..." There is in some writing on Chinese science an emphasis that it was a ding-an-sich, a thing in itself, and that it should be seen only in terms of the Chinese medieval thought system. On this view, we should not think of it in terms of modern science or judge it in terms of the latest textbook. However, such an approach might, I fear, lead us to a kind of Spenglerism in which the works of

each civilization are quite incommensurable with those of any other. Civilizations have, like living organisms, their times of growth, flowering, and decay, none being better or worse than any other, but simply different. This may be true of art, literature, and perhaps philosophy, but surely it will not do for science. For me the history of science is absolutely and inescapably one single story of man's knowledge of nature and his control over it, and the Chinese alchemical tradition ought surely to be related to this. Thus we should not fail to try to interpret in modern scientific terms the things the Taoist alchemists were doing. And again, we must not fail to tackle the hard task of comparative study. Finally, we must be on the lookout for possible transmissions and contacts between East and West.

Among the many good observations made in this paper is the point that the fundamental things in Chinese natural philosophy, scientific thought, and hence alchemy were time and cycles of time, not space and matter in space, though this became important in later Neo-confucianism. Among the places where the prominence of time cycles can be seen are the life-cycles in Chuang Tzu, the growth of metals in the earth, the periods in astronomy, the great circulation-mindedness of Chinese physiology and medicine, and of course the movement of the kua in the I Ching.

The way the yin-yang categories were applied is for me the beginning of the study of chemical affinity (See p. 14a of the paper). Then the material presented on pages 14a, 20, and 23 raises the question of how much emphasis there was on actual quantitative measurement and how much on numerology. For instance, surely Ch'en Shao-wei (See p.24) was working on the basis of some experiments, and not just deducing all his figures. These quantitative statements might be compared to

the Jabirian corpus of Arabic alchemy in the 9th and 10th centuries which contained so much numerology; might not that have been a transmission? The color sequences mentioned on pages 15 and 25 give partial but troubling parallels with the observations of the Hellenistic alchemists on melanosis, leucosis, xanthosis, and even tosis. More could certainly be made of this and of the question of the dating of the Hellenistic alchemical corpus and of possible influences from East Asia at that early date.

The idea of "projection", i.e., the power of small amounts of material to effect transmutation of large amounts (See p. 24) appears also in Hellenistic protochemistry in the 1st or 2nd centuries A.D. This raises acutely the question of comparative dating, and even of possible influences along the Old Silk Road.

Lastly, on p. 26 it is suggested that the evolution of chemistry in China was "abortive". Modern science, it is indeed true, began in Europe and not in China, but if there were seminal influences transmitted from East to West it may not really have been so abortive as it might appear.

Mr. Wright: I would like to ask about the sociological position of the alchemists. Who were they, and who were the artisan alchemists? How did the physicians fit into the picture?

Mr. Sivin: The theoretical alchemists tend to be firmly enmeshed in the Taoist complex. Other kinds of Taoism, such as invocations to Taoist deities, appear in their alchemical works. In one early alchemical work there is a preface attributed to Chang Tao-ling 張道陵. In many cases identifiable alchemists primarily concerned with making elixirs of immortality turn out to be physicians too.

We can see from the Chinese therapeutic and pharmacological literature that the authors were very learned men. They often had

the dignity of literary gentlemen and were known as ju i (儒醫). What were the sources of the data included in the books compiled by these so-called "gentlemen-physicians"? Medicines would probably not be included in a book which was expected to become a classic unless their efficacy had been proved already at the level of folk practice. We can equally not be sure how many of the alchemist's methods and how much of his equipment had been worked out at the "sub-literary" level.

Mr. deBary: Was the medical tradition completely empirical?

Mr. Sivin: When we investigate the medicines which were said to be therapeutic, we find that nearly all of them were justified in at least one of these three ways. First, some of them did what they were supposed to do; in other words, they worked. They were not the majority. Secondly, some were included because of sympathetic magic. Lastly, some were included for purely theoretical reasons, such as, for example, that they fitted into yin-yang or five elements rationalizations.

Mr. Mather: What about the role of metallurgists, such as jewelers and bronze-casters?

Mr. Sivin: At least before the Sung, nearly all alchemical equipment came from medicine. Some Sung alchemical equipment was designed primarily to fit schematic theories. As for the artisan traditions, there are some techniques used in practical alchemy which are closely related to some of these traditions. For example, it seems very likely that the interest in weight relations derives from metallurgical yields and assays.

Mr. Wright: What were the theoretical speculations about the nature of reality which were tested in the laboratory?

Mr. Sivin: The models they examined were not new speculations but rather old models of the Tao. The basic ones were the yin-yang cycle, the metaphysics of the Book of Changes, and the Five Elements.

Mercury and lead were put in the crucible because they were yin and yang, not because they symbolized them. In other words, the relationship was strict correspondence, not symbolic.

In alchemical treatises in the Yün chi ch'i ch'ien (雲笈七籤), there are special liturgies to be used in the alchemical laboratory. The chao (朝) or morning liturgy was especially prominent, and the deity Tzu wei chün jen (紫微君人) was among those invoked.

Mr. Ho: Liturgical observance appears less frequently in later texts, but I think they were meant to be taken for granted.

Mr. Sivin: Especially in the more theoretical alchemy, the actual eating of the elixir was perfunctory or even omitted as we see from the phrase "lien tan erh ch'eng hsien" (鍊丹而成仙) ('It is the refining of the elixir that makes you an immortal'). This was not as true in the more practical alchemical texts, but the most prevalent view was that one could not become immortal simply by eating an elixir. Certain kinds of "internal" techniques, moral behavior, ritual purity, and prayer were also necessary. It is most difficult in assessing the aims of alchemy to distinguish clearly between mystical union and intellectual understanding. If the alchemists used intellectual understanding as a means toward transcendence, we can understand more easily the place of the processes they used in the laboratory than if we explain the processes as mere objects of contemplation. In nearly all cases the alchemist was making the elixir for his own consumption; therefore we can see that his attention to the various spiritual practices makes sense. It was often said to be the responsibility of the alchemist to help the poor and the sick with medicines which he made by stopping the process at an earlier stage. After it had reached the stage of being an elixir, he would, if we take the texts at their word, only take it himself and not give it to anyone else.

Mr. Schipper: In the Southern Sung and the Yüan a separate ritual

called lien tu (煉度) was created for funeral purposes. This ritual, which is still done, consisted of an elixir being prepared ritually and symbolically using talismans (fu 符) and cauldrons and administered to the spirit of the dead person. This was a very important breaking point in the history of Taoist ritual because this was the first time ritual had been performed for an individual rather than for the community as a whole.

Mr. Ho: There are many instances of substances which, when taken in their natural state, could make you an immortal, and there was no need to prepare an elixir. It was also sometimes recommended that a person should prepare himself to take an elixir by fasting or taking vegetable drugs. Perhaps these were precautions the alchemist took because they knew that some substances were dangerous.

Mr. Sivin: According to one approach, one could take certain intermediate substances in order to lengthen one's lifespan so that one could have enough time to prepare a real elixir. It was also said that the best one could do with fang chung shu (房中術) was to attain eternal life, and not immortality. Certain signs were considered to be objective verification of immortality. Physical death was an absolute prerequisite. Then the embryo went off to the land of immortality; the sign of this was that the body did not decay. This may have been related to the fact that the heavy-metal compounds which were ingredients of the elixirs were good embalming agents. Some treatises give vivid descriptions of the effects of taking elixirs, including the hallucinations of mercury poisoning and the sensation that insects were crawling up and down your flesh, as well as ulcers or rashes. People were not worried when such things happened because they were said to indicate that the elixir was working.

Mr. Miyuki: Could you please explain the quantitative notions of time that were used? I would also appreciate more explanation of the notion that hsiang (象) does not denote a symbolic relation. Also I would like to know the sources of your interpretations of the Chou i ts'an t'ung ch'i.

Mr. Sivin: As for the quantitative notion of time, I was as surprised as anyone to find how important it was in cosmology. The sources speak for themselves.

I consider a book wai tan only if the chemical results of chemical operations are what the author says they are, and if the processes are unambiguously based on empirical experience in the laboratory. Often sources mix numbers which were obtained experimentally and those arrived at through numerology, and sometimes the two uses of numbers are indistinguishable.

I have discussed the concept of correspondence because Chinese science was not causal like ours but a science of correspondence. The interpretation of hsiang as "symbolic" in many old texts is philologically untenable.

I have looked over about twenty of the commentaries to the Chou i ts'an t'ung ch'i, which has lasted so long in general literature because it can be read on so many different levels. In order to understand the conflicts between the different interpretations, it is absolutely necessary to understand the arguments of the various commentaries in terms of different sects and individuals in their historical settings. Some interpretations are explicitly sexual, but these are not necessarily primary. The book was written on such a high primary level that both wai tan and nei tan filiate out of it.

Mr. Ho: The Sung commentaries to the Ts'an t'ung ch'i tended to emphasize alchemy, and the post-Sung commentaries emphasized nei tan.

The early 19th century commentary of Fu Chin-ch'üan 傅金銓 is an example of one which emphasized sexual techniques. As long as a commentary used the alchemical terms of the time it was written, we presuppose that alchemy was still being done.

Mr. Sivin: I would like to mention an article on the early history of the concept ch'i (氣) by Fukui Kojun 福井康順. It appeared in the first issue of Tōhōshūkyō 東方宗教 (ca/ 1953?), and many early citations dealing with ch'i are collected in it.

Mr. Welch: On p. 14a, water is given as one of the Five Elements, but how can it be both governed and governing, both acted upon and acting?

Mr. Sivin: This is typical of Chinese physics, in which an element can operate in many modes simultaneously.

Mr. Eliade: In India there was the same interest in health, longevity, and immortality. In hathayoga alchemy was related to secret doctrines and techniques. In the early Brahmanical texts and traditions in India we find the statement, "Gold is the image of immortality." We do not know whether only the metal is meant here or if gold is here a solar symbol. In the Mahaprajñāpāramitā-sastra of Nagarjuna, the original Sanskrit of which is lost but which has been translated into French from the extant Tibetan and Chinese versions by E. Lamotte, it is said that substance can be transmuted by two methods, medicinal herbs and the force of meditation. In speaking of immortality and longevity, the term embryonic body is used. A very close homologue of this is the use of the term "divine body" in speaking of bodily immortality. This body is created by means of yogic and alchemical techniques.

Mr. Needham: It was fundamental in Hellenistic alchemy to deprive the materia prima of its forms and then to impress upon it other forms instead of those it had before. What is the equivalent of this in

Chinese? If you think in terms of time and not matter, then this conception could not arise. What took its place?

Mr. Sivin: In Alexandrian theory, gold was made from base metals. Since any metal was thought to consist of various qualities imposed on matter, if you could strip off the qualities, then you would have the prima materia alone. Then you could impose on it the qualities of gold. There was nothing very similar to this in China. The Alexandrians seemed to have been interested in chemical explanations, but if we look at Chinese alchemy, we find that it was more like physics than like chemistry. The Chinese were more interested in laws of cyclical process and physical change than in the identification of substances and their changes from one substance into another.

Mr. Link: Did the Chinese regard a thing as the sum of its qualities?

Mr. Sivin: I can't answer since I don't know how to apply concepts like "quality" to Chinese science.

Mr. Schipper: In the Chinese scheme, the word for gold corresponds to the East, but East is the region of death, therefore, there is quite a bit of question about the use of gold in the Taoist vocabulary. What does it really stand for? There must be some qualitative characteristic.

Mr. Sivin: The Alexandrian technical scheme grew out of Greek thought--first Stoic and then Gnostic. Until we comprehend Chinese epistemology much better than we do now, we cannot apply rigorously the concepts of one culture to the systems of the other. We need to investigate.

FIRST INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON TAOISM

10th of September, 1968; Afternoon Session

Speaker: Mr. Ho P'eng-yü

Chairman: Mr. Arthur Wright

Commentator: Mr. Christopher Schipper

Title of Paper: "Taoism in Sung and Yüan China"

Mr. Ho: My first interest in the field of Chinese studies was the history of Chinese astronomy; having met Dr. Needham in 1958, I joined the project at Cambridge to study alchemy and the Tao Tsang. Returning to Malaya, interest in the field of alchemy was maintained by Mr. Sivin who studied with me in Kuala Lumpur the methods of chemical alchemy. I returned to Cambridge to assist Dr. Needham in writing the volume on Chinese chemistry. The chance to study the history of Taoism along with the history of alchemy was indeed a welcome task. The Sung and Yüan eras seemed the most important to understanding the peak of alchemical practices and their decline. Mr. Ho then turned to pointing out the corrections which had to be made in the paper, from further study on the subject, as well as certain typographical errors.

Mr. Schipper then commented on the paper, showing that it was divided into two parts; a study of Taoism in the Sung and Yüan based on Ch'en Yüan's important book, and a listing of the important sources on alchemy. Mr. Schipper suggested three topics for discussion brought up in the paper: 1) the restoration of the heavenly master Chang T'ien-shih in the Sung; 2) the early history of the Mao Shan P'ai (茅山派) as important to the understanding of what alchemy really was; and 3) a study of the Ch'uan Chen sect (全真派) in the Sung. Two emendations were pointed out: first,

did not the Cheng-i sect (正一) originate in the late Han, and not in the Sung, and second, the T'ien Shih Chang Chi-hsien was the 30th successor to Chang Tao-ling.

Mr. Wright: The theme of the sociological strata from which the Taoists came could perhaps be pointed out: The Taoist masters, practitioners, and physicians as well as the Taoists at court and where they came from and their place at court.

Mr. Sivin: Using the scheme of Mr. Wright, the two currents of Chinese society, the elite of upper society and the masses of the little tradition, there would seem to be a third stratum, the leadership or the elite of the lower society. Therefore the role of Taoist priets, closed sects, the Taoist countryside, and the organization of the laymen who are not from the upper society, who are not gentry, is essential to our discussion. Furthermore a discussion of alchemy and its place in Taoism means a discussion of the Mao Shan P'ai, and the "locus" of the alchemist tradition. This represents only one of many traditions, apart from the self-development of local-level communities.

Mr. Wright: agrees with the above distinction, i.e., the Taoist tradition was between the great and the little tradition, and most often provided the contacts between the two. All of the varieties of the local elite have not yet been adequately studied.

The discussion then continued on whether or not the scheme of great and little societies was relevant. Mr. Link suggested that it did not allow for an adequate description, Mr. Wright answering that it only provided a model for easy discussion and study of the topic, and Mr. Welch pointing out that there were many works looking at either side of the spectrum but not from the middle, so that Chinese studies to the present had made it look like a

polarization.

The discussion was then brought back by Mr. Sivin to the question of alchemy, describing how theoretical texts on alchemy have two ingredients, which correspond to the "Yin" and the "Yang", a sort of movement in the theoretical texts from proto-physics toward proto-chemistry, that is from two ingredient processes toward those involving two classes of ingredients. Mr. Welch then asked if the meaning was not rather a movement on the theoretical side from proto-physics to proto-chemistry, while on the practical side to proto-medicine. Mr. Sivin replied that this was not the case, since the pragmatic tendency was connected with well-developed medicine from the very beginning.

The discussion was then brought back again to the original request of Mr. Schipper for an elucidation of the history of the Mao Shan P'ai, which the Chairman, Mr. Wright agreed must be done, but hoping that the emphasis would be on historical aspects, with dates and place names.

Discussion on Mao Shan (博爾茅山論) by Mr. Schipper

I will limit myself to the early history of the Mao Shan sect. 1) Location: Mao Shan is the modern name for the Kuo Ch'ü Shan (句曲山) near Nanking, in the county of Tanyang (丹陽). An important religious center since the Three Kingdoms period. It was given the name of Mao Shan because of its association with the legend of three Mao brothers. (It has three peaks). The eldest and most important of the Mao brothers was Mao Ying (茅盈); the legends of the Mao brothers developed independently from the Mao Shan sect. However, the three brothers became important deities in the revelations produced in this

milieux. 2) The works produced by the sect are amongst the most important of religious Taoism. Amongst them the best known and also the most controversial is the Chen Kao (真誥). The bibliographies without exception attribute this work to T'ao Hung-ching (陶弘景), of the Liang dynasty. The original work I believe was in twenty chapters of which seventeen survive. These consist of short fragments of poetry, or prose, each followed by a note "...on such and such day, such and such a deity.... transmitted (授)." The date is probably about 360 AD, that is, the ten years more or less from 353-363, during the East Chin period (東晉). This indicates that the text of the Chen Kao were revealed to a group or "cenacle" on Mao Shan by mediumistic practices. First, how sure are we that the supposed revelations were so early, since most modern bibliographers say it was made up at a later date by T'ao Hung-ching? The end of the book (Ch. 17) explains how these documents were originally called "Tao Chi" (道迹), "Traces of the Tao" revealed to such and such a person, "which I (T'ao Hung-ching) have found and annotated." (Hu Shih has written of this, of the Hu Shih Wen Ts'un, where he uses it as a platform for anti-religious propaganda.) But we know these are of early composition from the "Wu Shang Pi-yao" (無上祕要) which contains bits of the "Tao Chi" (道迹) (i.e. corresponding to the text of the Chen Kao, from the Pei Chi (北齊) period). Also, the numerous hagiographies produced by the Mao Shan P'ai incorporates bits of the Tao Chi.

3) The earliest leaders of the Mao Shan P'ai were Hsü Mi, (許謚) and Yang Hsi (楊羲). Hsü Mi, it is generally known, was the chief clerk (長史) of the powerful Wang (王) family of Lang Ya (琅瑯) in Shantung. Hsü Mi's nephew married Ko Hung's

grandaughter. We could classify him socially as a kind of "petit bourgeoisie" (Mr. Sivin interposed, "middle-brow bourgeoisie"). Yang Hsi was the principle medium; the methods used were probably the "Fu Chi" (扶乩) spirit writing, (the planchette); it seems that some passages of the Chen Kao were products of visions. Let us now make a resumé of what I think are the principle characteristics of the early Mao Shan sect.

1) We have here the first example of what became one of the favorite pasttimes of scholars and officials alike, the Fu Luan (扶鸞). The art of the planchette has been and is practised extensively throughout China, by the officers of the army, by the secret societies, and by the gentry of the country.

2) The Mao Shan sect socially belonged to the middle class. It was a closed group of adepts. The contemporary liturgical tradition of the Cheng-I P'ai are almost wholly absent in the text of the Mao Shan P'ai. Equally the Ling Pao rituals seem not to have been performed by them; in a similar way the Yün Chi Ch'i ch'ien (雲笈七籤) also stands apart from the liturgical tradition. From the beginning then this mediumistic sect was syncretistic. This is reflected in the Chen Kao, where for instance, we find passages from the "Erh-shih-ssu Chang Ching" (二十四章經), the twenty-four chapter Sutra, or from a passage which tells how many Buddhist apocryphal scriptures were revealed to a Buddhist nun in one of the temples of Mao Shan (cf. Demieville's article--lectures--in the Annuaire of the College de France). We may remark that by definition all mediumistic texts are syncretistic.

3) The Mao Shan sect is identifiable in the revelations of the Shang Ch'ing Ching (上清經), the thirteenth chapters revealed by the matriarch Wei Hua Ts'un (魏華存), to Yang Hsi, which is

a disciplined text for interior meditation. Today's Shang Ch'ing Ching is not entirely of that time, of course, especially in the Cheng-i Pu section (正乙部). But it does contain earlier fragments of the 3rd century, a question which needs further critical study. The above mentioned Wei Hua Ts'un is also called "Nan Yü Fu-jen (南嶽夫人), a female libationer (祭酒) of the Cheng-i sect! For Chang Tao-ling transmitted the Tao to his daughters as well as his sons. She transmits liturgical information as well, that is, how to contact the spirits in the "Pure Room" (清室).

4) It is, perhaps, not wrong to believe that hallucinatory drugs were burned in the milieux of Mao Shan alchemy.

Second half of the session

Mr. Wright opened the second part of the session by asking Mr. Ho to explain something of the Taoism of the Hui Tsung Emperor, who was not a Taoist until about forty years of age. As recorded by Confucian historians he wasted the reserves of the nation by building a huge mountain-complex in K'aifeng, including lakes, peaks, etc. Aside from the bald details of the historians, could we know more of the kinds of Taoism practised, and so forth.

Mr. Ho: During the reign of Hui Tsung the Tao Tsang was printed for the first time, many texts were compiled, and official ranks for the Taoists and the magicians at court as civil servants were created. The thirtieth patriarch of the Cheng-i Taoist sect, Chang Chi-hsien (張繼先) was patronized by the court.

Mr. Wright: Where did the Taoists come from, whom he patronized, that is, geographically and socially what was their origin?

Mr. Sivin: One of the earliest texts is in the Han Fei-tzu where it is recorded that when Ch'in Shih-huang began his alchemical

practices, the gentlemen (士) of the Ch'i laid down their hoes and came to the court.

Mr. Schipper then pointed out how the restoration of the Lung Hu Shan patriarch, the thirtieth successor of Chang T'ien-shih as head of the folk religion, was also in Hui-tsung's time, a sort of marriage between church and state. It is interesting that the same thing was said by the Confucian historians of Chen-tsung's time; but where Hui-tsung failed, Chen-tsung succeeded, as is described in Goodrich's History of China. There were urgent political reasons for Hui-tsung's patronage of Taoism; he had to acquire some sort of charisma to attain popular support, due to the menace of the Yüan dynasty. Hui-tsung, seeing his realm threatened tried the same means that Chen-tsung had used before...an attempt to link up the sub-government with the court.

Mr. Wright then asked if the threat to Hui-tsung's throne was from without as well as from within, that is from the people as well as from foreign invaders. Mr. Schipper pointed out how difficult it was to study the succession of the patriarchs of the Cheng-i sect, who claimed to be descendants of the Wu-tou-mi-tao and Chang Tao-ling of the Han. Both the T'ien-shih in Chen-tsung's time, the twentieth descendant, and the thirtieth descendant in Hui-tsung's time claimed this descendancy, but the ritual they introduced at court was of the "Lei-fa" (雷法) type which had nothing to do with the ancient Cheng-i (正乙) ritual.

Mr. Needham asked for clarification of some of the above points, from Mr. Schipper, pointing out that some of the leading makers of hydro-mechanical clockwork at the Sung court were Taoists. Mr. Ho mentioned that the astronomers too were Taoist. The discussion continued, and Mr. Welch then asked Mr. Ho if the geneologies of the Taoists were in any way like those of the Buddhists whose lineage systems employ verses to identify generations. Mr. Schipper answered

that the Taoist geneologies used such a system as well and cited pg. 19 diagram 2 of Mr. Ho's text, showing how all the names of disciples of one master had an identifying single Chinese character. More similar comparisons were made in the following discussion. The interchange took place on Chu Hsi's commentary on the Chou-i Ts'an T'ung Chi, and the real authorship.

Mr. Sivin then brought up the problem of whether or not Ko Hung or T'ao Hung-ching ever really made elixirs, or actually practiced Wai Tan themselves. Mr. Kaltenmark replied that Ko Hung had seen it but not practised it; and that Ko Hung belonged to the medium-istic milieu. Mr. Schipper then added that we should not draw too close a line between medical practitioners, alchemists, technicians, and Taoists. Mr. Sivin continued with the point that the dominant tradition since the Sung has been to interpret all of the texts with a Nei Tan interpretation, and to consider the Wai Tan as a hoax. The problem is to determine to what extent the two were performed simultaneously, and which of the texts are purely Wai Tan. Mr. Sivin's suggestion that the Wai Tan practises were eventually abortive was questioned by Mr. Needham, who said that if one examined the transmissions of Chinese alchemical ideas to the West at several historical periods, one would find some of the most important ideas of the alchemists came to fruition in modern chemistry. Mr. Schipper then concluded this part of the discussion with the note that the use of the mirror in the Wai Tan alchemic practises, the mirror having the notion of "introspection", to look into the interior melting pot, perhaps gave priority to the Nei Tan.

FIRST INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON TAOISM

12th of September, 1968; Morning Session

Speaker: Mr. Miyuki

Chairman: Mr. Welch

Commentator: Mr. de Bary

Title of Paper: "Taoist Zen presented in the Hui Ming Ching"

Mr. Miyuki: began with a description of a personal history and his interest in Nei Tan. The method of the paper was one of inner experience. The unconscious process was explained, as well as the Jungian terminology used in the paper.

Mr. deBary: pointed out some of the differences of method between the sinologist, especially in the West, and the method of the paper. The method of textual analysis would perhaps yield a different result from the Jungian analysis. Some textual discrepancies were pointed out.

Mr. Sivin: Mr. Miyuki has made an important contribution by revealing in this text familiar patterns of individuation, just as Jung has uncovered basic psychic patterns in Western alchemy. This strengthens the therapeutic armament of Jungian psychology by demonstrating what aspects of the Hui Ming Ching are universal. In order to understand, as we also wish to do, those aspects unique to Chinese tradition, we must compare Mr. Miyuki's psychological analysis with the techniques which are actually being performed.

We begin with the key term "ch'iao" (竅), or "opening," and its significance for the adept. (Although the text says the technique can be carried out without a teacher, anyone who came to it would have tried other more conventional techniques first under guidance; it was, as for Liu Hua-yang himself, a text for dropouts). The text uses elementary and familiar medical terminology; when we

analyze the use of such terms as 海底龍宮 (the dragon palace at the bottom of the ocean = the male edifice below the bladder 氣海), the 命門 (scrotum), and the 玄關 (the portion of the urethra in back of the scrotum which is pressed in sexual techniques in order to "cycle" the semen instead of ejaculating), we see that we are dealing with a sexual discipline of a common type, in which (as the text puts it), "When the three fires (the semen) goes out in the positive direction it makes human beings; when it comes in in the negative direction it completes the tao." The text is characterized as an integral combination of two techniques: 1) a semen-cycling technique involving masturbation (manual or mental) rather than a sexual partner, and at the same time 2) an "interior alchemy" breath technique with much Tantric content. Such techniques are known to have been performed even in modern times (Schipper). As for the Tantric content, perhaps that explains Liu's insistence that his actual diagrams derive from the Leng-yen sutra, and that his method also owes much to the Garland Sutra. These assertions make sense on the hypothesis of an esoteric tradition of interpretation.

Kaltenmark: The text is both difficult, and not so important as earlier texts which are far easier to understand. The tradition is a very ancient one, found even in the Han.

Mr. Schipper: pointed out that we could perhaps see in this a pattern of "lien" (鍊) in alchemy, the melting of metals. Nei Tan and sexual practises accompany and assist in alchemy. In the Taoist tradition it is called "小門" (back door) and "傍道" (side line) but in reality it is a central theme.

Mr. Wright: Hellmut Wilhelm published in Monumenta Serica an inscription from the top of a staff, of the early Chan Kuo (Warring States) period, ca. 5th century BC, using almost the same words

as this text. It must be a very ancient practise.

Mr. Sivin: The first law of western science is the principle of sufficient reason, of Anaximander. In a situation not known, assume the possibilities are equally distributed, so that we assert that a text belongs to a particular tendency (e.g. Wai Tan) only when the details point overwhelmingly to a special concern on the part of the author. We have good reason, at the same time, to know that even a laboratory alchemy text reflects parallel knowledge of breath and even sexual techniques, that more than one level of meaning is usually operating.

Mr. Wright: There are, as it were, three bodies of practice, alchemy, physics, and philosophy drawing on a common stream of metaphor coming down from extreme antiquity. Therefore in any one of the texts there are one real and two metaphorical interpretations.

Mr. Kaltenmark: The Chuang-tzu already contains the words "Jen Tu" (任督), the two arteries, with the prectise of returning to the "Hun T'un" (渾沌). (A discussion then followed on finding this passage in Chuang-tzu) Following this was a query by Mr. Welch as to the proportion of Wai Tan texts in the Tao Tsang, which Mr. Sivin estimated to be about 100. The meaning of the two arteries "Jen" and "Tu" was then discussed.

Mr. Kaltenmark: explained that "Jen" extended from the lower lip down, and "Tu" from the base of the spine, over the head, to the upper lip. One of the illustrations in Mr. Miyuki's text shows this. The Yin and the Yang are thus represented, and the unity of the human person, the Hun T'un being divided and diversified into the multiple spirits of the body. The idea is to restore the unity of the body, to connect the two halves, "Jen" and "Tu", and thus restore the Yüan Ch'i (元氣).

In dealing with the historic and social background of Mr. Miyuki's

text we must eventually answer three questions:

- 1) The history of the "Three Teachings" (三教歸一) current.
- 2) Dating of Liu Hua-yang and texts associated with him.
- 3) Accounting for the presence of Tantrism.

There are Tantrist elements in the Mao-shan tradition from very early times. Po Chü-i has a poem on the Three Teachings in the T'ang. Yang Chia-lo found evidence of a Five Dynasties sanctuary at Mt. Wu-tao (吳道山) near Chengtu, with images of patriarchs of the Three Teachings. The earliest Three Teachings school texts in the Tao Tsang are apparently from the Southern Sung; e.g., a commentary of ca. 1000 on the Yü Huang ching (玉皇經). But the Three Teachings ideology is not universal; it is essentially Taoist, widely accepted by Taoists and rejected by the Buddhist and Confucian establishment. There was some semi-official status, especially in the Ming Wan-li period, when certain examiners allowed in the official examinations responses based on such shan shu 善書 as the T'ai shang kan ying p'ien 太上感應篇. Even in the Ch'ing period of reaction, the famous philologist Yü Yueh 余越 wrote a commentary on the latter work. There is much Tantric material (e.g. the Peacock Sutra) in the Tao tsang from the Ming on.

In the Tun-huang MSS there is an early T'ang copy of the Chen kao with Tibetan annotations. Does this reflect a channel for Tantrism?

Liu Hua-yang's school within the Three Teachings is called the "Eastern School," and claims connection with the 三峯 tendency.

Eliade: one of the most interesting aspects of the discussion has been for me the relation of it to the pre-history and proto-history of religion. I was very interested by Professor Miyuki's text and

would like to bring up three things for comparison:

1) The idea of returning to the original state of cosmic oneness and its relation in the text to the creation and nourishing of an embryo, through sexual techniques. All these things are together a regression and uterum, going back to the origins. Both sexual techniques and the creation of an embryo are universal archaic beliefs. Initiation always means a rebirth...in the Indian initiation (*dīkṣā*), the brahman transforms the candidates into an embryo. Taking it as a pan-Indian tradition, we find it too in Buddhism. In *Majjhima nikāya* we find the text, "I have shown to my disciples how to create a new body from an intellectual substance, provided with transcendant qualities." There is a parallel in the passage where Buddha tells his disciples to acquire new bodies, where the monk becomes Buddha's son...Kasyana says of himself: "I am the son of Buddha because I was born of his mouth and his Dharma." This is found also in St. Paul's letter to Philemon where he asks for the freedom of the slave Onesimus, "whom I have begotten", given re-birth, and new life. These ideas all seem very similar here.

2) Tantric sexual techniques are similar to Taoistic in that there is no ejaculation, but the subsequent experience is different. For the Tantric practitioner, the experience is one of becoming a non-human being, or a not naturally human person, i.e., doing exactly the contrary of instinct. He, as it were, breaks through to a new kind of existence. Mr. Schipper added that this was true of the Taoist in the flame "breaking through" the top of the head, and the experience of the Taoist priest of his "hair standing on end" as a physical phenomenon.

3) on pg. 32 and 33 of the paper, the description of "golden

light," "the body is jumping," and so forth, seem to be literally translated from Hatha-yoga texts.

4) As in the Secret of the Golden Flower, the circulation of light prepares the embryonic body--in late Tantric and Hatha-yoga, the immortal body--clearly the working towards a "parallel" body, related to the original one. Is the use of light for rebirth and sexual symbolism different in the Chinese and Indian experience?

5) Jung's relation to this is very interesting. For "Jung" "totality" and not "perfection" was the ideal of man. "Perfection" is not human; it is angelic, demonic, or abstract. Whereas the goal of man is toward "totality"; mysterious techniques of the union of opposites. Alchemy can be seen as a kind of union of opposites for completion. Thus Plato's ideal of the perfection of humanity was not really human.

Mr. Kaltenmark pointed out that the meaning of "Chen Jen" (真人) the "realized man" meant precisely this; the man who had "realized totality."

FIRST INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON TAOISM

Monday, September 13, 1968

Chairman: Arthur F. Wright

Introductory Remarks: Mr. Holmes Welch

Topic: Problems in the Study of the Taoist Tradition

Mr. Wright: Our purpose today is to try to identify the kinds of sub-fields and themes which need study and research.

Mr. Welch: I have made a list of the problems which the participants have said urgently need to be done and divided them into several categories.

The first category includes subjects which are large and important and too big for a first book.

The first of these is monastic Taoism. This would include such things as the state of repair of the monasteries, their holdings, their rules, and the social backgrounds of the monks. There is a book by Peter Goulart and an article by F. S. Drake (in Monumenta Serica, about 1939) about Taoist monasteries.

The second subject is the concepts of after-life in China. I have been troubled by Maspero's notion that there was no such concept in China before the introduction of Buddhism.

The third subject is the mutual influence between Tantrism and Taoism.

The fourth is the relationship between the orthodox Taoist sects and the secret societies and non-orthodox Taoist sects. For the latter, see an article by Margery Topley, Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies, XXVI (1962).

The fifth is the conflict between the Taoists and the modernists; for example, the effect of Christianity.

The last is Taoist activities in contemporary China.

I have made a second category of subjects which we might be able to investigate effectively with our present state of knowledge. These subjects are the following:

The relationship between Taoism and aesthetics.

The role of mediums in Taoism.

The comparison of Taoist and Buddhist genealogical systems and an investigation of their sociological consequences.

The gaps in our knowledge of alchemy.

Hallucinatory techniques from their very beginnings.

The development of fang chung (房中).

The influence of Buddhism on the institutions, liturgy, etc. of Taoism.

The political role of Taoism from the Han to the Ch'ing; for example, the relationships between Taoist and government leaders.

The relationships between religious Taoism and geomancy (feng-shui 風水) and divination.

I think it is very important that some kind of publication come from this conference for several reasons. It could be very useful for undergraduates in courses in the history of religions; it could attract the interest of graduate students, and it could show funding agencies that we have something. We could decide where the gaps are and ask the conference participants or others to fill them. Also, we could simply ask certain authors to write or combine these two approaches. We should have a publication to fill the existing gaps. The preface to such a volume might show the threads of various kinds which run through Taoism and discuss such problems as whether or not the term Taoism refers to one coherent whole. For example, does it rule out shen-chiao (神教)?

Mr. Wright: It might be in the form of a small manual of Taoist studies. It could include a discussion of technical terms, a short historical introduction and outline, and a preview of the discoveries made to date about the Tao Tsang.

Mr. Schipper: There are some 1400 titles in the Tao Tsang, and we do not know when they were written in a period of about eight hundred years. Each of the subjects suggested by Mr. Welch would take many years or a lifetime. In Taiwan now there are young people who have had an old-fashioned Chinese education in school. These people can help do the reference works which are necessary to draw these materials into accessibility. We need bibliographies, concordances, and indices. For the last several years, my assistants and I have completed or partially completed the following works to meet these needs:

Published

Schipper, K. M., ed. Concordance du Pao-p'ou-tseu Nei-p'ien (Pao-p'u-tzu Nei-p'ien T'ung-chien 抱朴子內篇通檢). Travaux d'Index, de Bibliographie et de Documentation Sinologiques publiés par L'Institut des Hautes Études Chinoises de l'Université, de Paris. Printed in Taiwan, December, 1965. 755 pp. En vente, Librairie Adrien Maisonneuve, 11 Rue Saint-Sulpice, Paris VIe.

Ready for Publication

Concordance du Pao-p'ou-tseu Wai-p'ien (Pao-p'u-tzu Wai-p'ien T'ung-chien 抱朴子外篇通檢).

Yün Chi Ch'i Ch'ien T'ung-chien (雲笈七籤通檢). Vol. 1, chüan 1-58.

Huang-t'ing nei wai ching ching T'ung-chien (黃庭內外景經通檢). Included is an index to the oldest commentary which is attributed to Wu-ch'eng Tzu (務成子).

Cheng-t'ung Tao Tsang Mu-lu T'i-mu T'ung-chien (正統道藏目錄題目通檢). One of the features of this index is that it breaks down and cross-references the titles in the Tao Tsang which often have long prefixes.

Now Being Completed

Tao Te Ching Shih-szu k'an pen T'ung-chien (道德經十四刊本通檢). This concordance includes a critical text based on fourteen editions and a Tun-huang MSS and an index to two or three of the earliest commentaries.

Yün Chi Ch'i Ch'ien T'ung-chien (雲笈七籤通檢). Vol. II, chüan 59-122 (i.e., the end). To be finished, June, 1969.

Dictionnaire Biographie du Taoisme. The files for this based on the Tao Tsang have already been completed.

We are now going through the Tao Tsang for all the names of temples and place names. It has been suggested that an index or concordance to the T'ai P'ing Ching (太平經) would also be useful. A concordance is really as much work as an index, and the audience of users, which would include linguists and phonologists, is much larger. There is a problem about the publication of these concordances as the University of Paris is very short of money, but it is difficult to get the rights away from them. There are excellent printing facilities in Taiwan.

For the development of our studies, my notion is that some kind of international collaboration might be good. It could be issued in a large series and have several editors; for example, Mr. Kaltenmark, Mr. Welch, and a Japanese scholar. Among the things that could be done are translations and studies of Taoist catechisms.

Mr. Kaltenmark: The preparation of a book from this conference would not be so good as it would lack unity. A series of publications or monographs would be better.

For quite a few years, I have been preparing a glossary of Taoist terms.

Mr. Sivin: The Hsien-hsüeh Tz'u'tien (仙學辭典) has been published in Taiwan (T'aipei: no publisher given, Min-kuo, 51st year, 175 pp.) by Tai Yuän-chang (戴源長), who formerly published the Hsien-hsüeh Pao (仙學報) in Shanghai. Mr. Kaltenmark, Yoshioka Yoshitoyo, and Michel Soymié have finished a bibliography of western works on Taoism, and it will be published in 1969. Professor Yoshioka is preparing a bibliography of Japanese works on Taoism.

Mr. Sivin: What we really need is an annotated bibliography.

Mr. Schipper: To date, the series Dōkyō Kenkyū (道教研究) (Études Taoistes) (Tokyo: Shoshinsha 昭森社 Vol. I, 1965. Pp. 291. Vol. II, 1967. Pp. 292. In Japanese with French summaries and some plates reproducing manuscripts. Vol. III, the intended date of publication is 1969, will include the bibliography mentioned above and more articles.) is a private affair of Yoshioka and Soymié. If possible, we should give or consider giving them support.

Mr. Kaltenmark: There are problems about defining Taoism. For example, when did it begin? A series of monographs should include studies of Taoist practices and folklore in antiquity.

Mr. Sivin: There is the problem of whether you should publish your own work as soon as you have looked at it or when every note is done. The usual procedure is that as you read a book you get a series of ideas which change as you read more. The question is to know when you have something to say to a wide audience and when you can say it responsibly. You must know and understand the complete literature of your subject. As most of the Japanese work that has been done is much under-represented at this meeting, we need an annotated bibliography of Japanese work on Taoism. Topics like hallucinogenics require a researcher who knows their medicinal aspects, Chinese medicine, and all corners of Taoism. The latter would include, for example, screening the complete Tao Tsang. I've learned that you must know the social background of whatever you're studying. For example, if you study Chinese science, you must also study magic, religion and other subjects.

Mr. de Bary: We need a report on current research and a review of past studies. Perhaps this could encourage those who are working now. It would be better to have a series of volumes or to have some of the papers which have been presented here published in an issue of a review like Professor Eliade's. However, at this point we should emphasize the translation from French or Japanese into

English of works of a more general nature. We also ought to emphasize the translation of basic texts or parts of basic texts in order to let people know what is there. Finding a publisher is not the main problem, because university presses are clamoring for works to publish, as long as they don't have too much apparatus.

Additional conferences could help. They should try to identify the kinds of related topics which would help the specialists in their work. There is a very great need for the study of early Chinese religion, from which many things derive. Therefore, a conference with this aim would be very good. Comparative studies are very useful. I think we are not ready for a volume now.

Miss Seidel: We must simultaneously add to lists like Mr. Welch's and do concordances and such. We need a concrete decision at the end of this session as to whether or not there will be a publication. As for our project at Paris of making a glossary of Taoist terms, perhaps we could make available a xerox copy of the glossary in its present state. This could be done very quickly, but it would be very provisional.

Mr. Needham: There is an urgent danger of the disappearance of things like monastic Taoism. The fang-chih (方志) of Taoist abbeys and shan-chih (山志) would be useful for the study of monasticism. We should not neglect foreign writers like Berton-Rouche. There was a journal which began publication in Shanghai in about 1900 called The Chinese Journal of Science and Arts which would be useful. It is semi-scholarly, but it includes accounts of visits to Taoist abbeys by such writers as Rewi Alley.

Alchemy can be conceived of as the study of Taoist participation in science and proto-science.

Wu Chi-yü (吴其昱) has studied the mutual influence between Buddhism and Taoism.

Another subject which should be studied is the role of Taoism in politics, revolutions, and rebellions.

Mr. Link: Many different kinds of comparative studies would be quite useful. Medicine is one kind, an instance of which is the account of the embryo in the Yogācārabhūmi-sūtra, which has been studied by Paul Demiéville. Folk religion is another kind. Of all the subjects which have been mentioned, only "pure" alchemy as such is not subject to comparative treatment.

I have made a list of other possible subjects for study:

The influence of their religion and their religious affiliations on the place of the Taoists in the political hierarchy and their involvement in politics.

The development of Taoist literature.

Psychological studies of Taoism.

Were there any proto-dictionaries or collections of technical terms?

The comparison of the immortal (hsien-jen 仙人) and the bodhisattva.

The study of the san-chiao (三教) movement.

The idea of Taoism as the passive or yin side of Chinese tradition.

Conceptual patterns which seem to hold over a long period of time such as the organic model.

Mr. Mather: Much of my work on the Shih-shuo Hsin-yü (世說新語) is helped by the kinds of studies we have discussed here, because I find out about things which were related to Taoism that I didn't know about. For instance, the way the "smaller tradition" is related to the "greater tradition" in the cases of Wang Hsi-chih and T'ao Ch'ien. Another example is that some poetry of the Six Dynasties seems to reflect some esoteric tradition of meditation as in Sun Ch'o's (孫綽) "Yu t'ien-t'ai-shan fu (遊天台山賦)." "

Mr. Miyuki: The introduction of Buddhism into China ought to be studied and related to the concept of an after-life in China. Such concepts could be

discussed in a wider context.

Mr. Eliade: Many of the technical terms of Taoism are present from the beginning of Chinese culture, and this raises the question of when Taoism began. It is interesting that in a book by Carl Hentze in his discussion of the symbolism of Shang bronzes he finds at an historical level the same symbolism of yin-yang, the Tao, the importance of integrating, etc. The point is that we see the roots of Taoism in Chinese proto- or pre-history. Now R. A. Stein and Professor Kaltenmark have discussed the symbolism of the houses. The notion of the periodical renewal of the world is still part of present-day Taoism. We also find in Taoism so much shamanistic symbolism if not technique. Taoism shows symbiosis with India if not possible mutual influence. The study of early Chinese religion is very important.

Mr. Wright: There seem to be three things which we should consider doing or helping:

Mr. Schipper's concordance

The publications of Yoshioka and Soymié

The Paris glossary-vocabulary

Mr. Schipper: There is much to be gained from some coordinated effort such as a series of monographs and reference works. Mr. de Bary said that the Committee on Chinese Thought of the A.C.L.S. would perhaps be willing to sponsor such a project, and a university press might be willing to publish it. Therefore, we should establish an international editing committee here. Some things, such as indices, translations of Japanese articles and others, could be published immediately.

Mr. Wright: The history of international projects shows that there are great difficulties. A spark plug is necessary.

Mr. Schipper: My only aim is some organization which could help to publish things when they are ready.

Mr. Wright: I would suggest a survey of where Taoist studies are today. It would cover what has been done, where the gaps are, and mention major studies. It might be in the form of a long journal article.

Mr. Schipper: In Paris there is a group very well qualified for such a task and in touch.

Mr. Kaltenmark: We had a revolution. All is uncertain now, but in a few weeks we will know.

Mr. Sivin: Could you use outside financial support?

Mr. Welch: We should not forget the state of curriculum; i.e., what courses are given where that include Taoism.

Mr. Wright: Mr suggestion was for a research oriented map of the field of study published in French or English.

Mr. Sivin: The most important educational use is at the most general level.

Mr. Wright: Professor Kaltenmark's book Lao Tseu et le Taoisme (Paris: Éditions du Seuil, 1965) will be published in an English translation by the Stanford University Press in a few months. Mr. Schipper will correspond and write a medium length journal article.

Mr. Welch: It ought to include one paragraph of a few sentences as an educational challenge.

Mr. Wright: We can't underwrite journals, but we can help publish symposia which are more or less complete. We can help with such matters as typing and editing.